

WRITTEN EVIDENCE TO THE INDEPENDENT WELSH PAY REVIEW BODY

March 2025

Community

3rd Floor
67/68 Long Acre
Covent Garden
London
WC2E 9JD

01332 372337

www.community-tu.org



Introduction

- i. Community is once again pleased to present our evidence to The Review Body.
- ii. Community is a general trade union representing thousands of workers across diverse occupations and industries throughout the UK.
- iii. Our education section is made up of teachers and lecturers, classroom and administrative support staff, nannies and early years professionals, tutors, site staff and more, all who work together to ensure the best provision possible is available to pupils and learners every day.
- iv. We strongly urge the Review Body to adopt the measures proposed in this document to ensure that the education sector retains the dedicated professionals who are so essential to its success.
- v. General Secretary Roy Rickhuss CBE said:
"The collective body of evidence that Community and other unions provide, and have done over the past few years, is essential in understanding the picture as seen by those quite literally at the chalkface, laying bare the issues faced by real people in their workplaces every day."
- vi. *"Our submission to the pay body mirrors the strength of feeling amongst our members in the education workforce of the need to make the sector an attractive place to work once again. This should be reflected not just in a substantive pay uplift, but with improved conditions, and especially action to tackle unsustainable workloads."*
- vii. *"We welcome the UK Labour Government's commitment to education and public services. We want to build this partnership on behalf of our members, and this submission is an important opportunity for us to set out their pressing priorities."*
- viii. Helen Osgood, National Officer for Education and Director of Operations, said:
"This evidence-based response to the Independent Welsh Pay Review Body highlights the real challenges faced by our members."
- ix. *"Our members play a vital role in delivering structured, high-quality learning in classrooms across the country. Community recognises the positive work that has already been undertaken, however there is always more that can be achieved, and this document outlines some of the positive changes that Community would like to see."*
- x. *"Inspiring and educating a generation is no small task, and our members are ready to meet this challenge head-on. This contribution must be fully recognised by the Government, the media and the public, giving educators the support and standing in the community that they deserve and the proper investment to succeed."*
- xi. *"Retention remains a critical issue in the education sector, and raising pay levels to those not seen since 2010 is essential to ensuring that educators feel valued and supported. This, in turn, empowers them to do what they do best: teach and inspire the next generation."*

- xii. *“We support the independence of the Review Body – as highlighted in the name – and the process for sharing the views of teachers and leaders who work in the classrooms up and down the country. It is they who will be most affected by any recommendations made; therefore, it is vital that our members, and all constituent parties, have trust in the recommendations it makes.”*
- xiii. National Secretary, Alun Davies, said:
“The education profession continues to work in a climate of underfunding, increasingly high workload, and pressure to deliver. Teachers up and down Wales are facing real challenges, with some having to take on second jobs to ensure that they can meet basic living requirements.”
- xiv. *“Community is committed to working together with the IWPRB and the Welsh Government to improve pay and conditions for our members and all those who work in education in Wales.”*
- xv. *“We urge the IWPRB to acknowledge the commitment, dedication and determination of our teachers and make the changes necessary to secure the workforce for future generations.”*

The Graduate Labour Market in the United Kingdom

1. Due to economic challenges and the changing nature of work for graduates within office based graduate roles it is vital that the education sector makes itself more appealing to graduates in the modern working world.
2. The national mission of high standards and aspirations for all is an ambitious goal for the Welsh Government. And we are pleased with the commitment of The Department on working with the sector to recruit new teachers, with support for career-long professional learning and a commitment to manage workload and reduce bureaucracy but more remains to be tackled.
3. The economy has faced key challenges in past few years, such as COVID-19, 14 years of austerity, Brexit and the changing face of government across the whole of the UK. This has led to significant pain in the jobs market. Mostly this has been felt in sectors largely employing non-graduates, such as retail and services,¹ and this meant that although the economy slowly got weaker in the last year, the jobs market, particularly for graduates, was a little stronger than the rest of the economy might suggest.²
4. According to *What do Graduates do?*, the 2021/22 cohort of graduates has a lower full-time employment rate than 2019/20 graduates (59% versus 59.6%) although 80% are employed, with 72% on permanent contracts. Consequently, it has a slightly higher unemployment rate (5.6% against 5%). These figures still speak of a relatively good labour market and compare favourably with those from 2019/20.³ And the Bank of England reported that there were widespread shortages in health, education, social care, engineering, software development and finance at graduate level. This means that the labour market for graduates into 2025 is likely to be quite similar to the last couple of years.⁴
5. Indeed, employers in thirteen out of fifteen key industries and business sectors predicted they would maintain or increase the number of graduate vacancies at their organisation in 2023. Unfortunately for teachers, the two exceptions were accounting & professional services firms, and the public sector.⁵
6. Together, the country's leading graduate employers anticipated taking on more than 3,000 additional graduates beyond their original recruitment targets for 2023.⁶ This is a rise of more than 6% year-on-year, meaning that there are fewer graduates available to go into teaching. However, due to the fear of recession, graduate recruitment was actually 6.4% lower in 2023 than it had been the previous year, rather than the 6.3% increase predicted in January 2023.⁷
7. And even though this figure, set in September 2023, has been revised down to a 1.5% increase, the speed at which the market changes means that many will have discounted a career in education in favour of better paid employment in another sector.

¹ "What Do Graduates Do?" (2024/25), Jisc/Prospects/AGCAS, Page 11.

<https://luminare.prospects.ac.uk/what-do-graduates-do>

² "What Do Graduates Do?" (2024/25) Page 11.

³ "What Do Graduates Do?" (2024/25) Page 8.

⁴ "What Do Graduates Do?" (2024/25) Page 11.

⁵ High Fliers Research Centre, "The Graduate Labour Market in 2024" (2024) Page 10.

<https://www.highfliers.co.uk/>

⁶ High Fliers 2024, Page 10.

⁷ High Fliers 2024, Page 11.

8. According to *What do Graduates do?*, 7.2% of graduates are employed as education professionals 15 months after graduation, with primary and secondary teaching professionals occupying positions four and five, in the list of top ten professional jobs held by first degree graduates.⁸ And, whilst teaching in secondary education comes third in the list of top ten professional jobs held by first-degree graduates, for subjects such as Computer Science, which have long-standing recruitment shortages, teaching does not feature in the list at all.⁹ And only around 9% to 15% of biology, chemistry, physics, and physical and geographical sciences graduates entered the education/teaching sector.¹⁰
9. Pay is a significant issue for graduates, who are leaving university with some of the highest debt ever seen in the UK. Current estimates indicate that students leave university with £45,000 of debt¹¹ to be repaid over an average of 40 years. When coupled with a standard 7.1% interest rate, and the requirement to repay undergraduate and postgraduate loans at the same time on earnings above the threshold, students can find themselves being deducted around 41% of salary, when including tax, National Insurance and student loan Repayments.
10. The median graduate starting salary on offer from the UK's leading employers has risen, to £34,000 for graduates starting work in 2024. This is an increase of £500 compared to the median salary paid to new graduates in 2023, and means that graduate pay has risen by 13.3% since 2021.¹² And whilst the starting salary for teachers has risen considerably since 2021 to its current rate of £32,433, this remains some £1,500 shy of comparable graduate roles, especially when considering that more than a quarter of graduate jobs at the country's leading employers now have initial salaries of £40,000 or more¹³
11. But it is not just pay. According to *What do students want?*, **"Money isn't everything"**. Young jobseekers care about money, but they also want to hear about the wider opportunities that organisations will provide them with, the likely work-life balance, and the ethical and environmental positioning of organisations.¹⁴ And flexibilities, such as hybrid working, compressed hours and mentoring support, are all things which new graduates are looking for in their first employment.
12. And it's not just the employees. Only 5% of employers expected their graduate hires to be fully office based, and nearly a quarter expect them to work from home for at least three days per week.¹⁵
13. In England, some academy trust such as Dixons, have been exploring what this might mean in schools and we are sure that their findings will be closely considered by the whole sector to understand the appeal, take up and possible impact. Yes, it might make timetabling more complicated, but without sufficient high-quality teachers, that would already be impossible.

⁸ "What Do Graduates Do?" (2024/25) Pp 6-7.

⁹ "What Do Graduates Do?" (2024/25) Pp 51-53.

¹⁰ "What Do Graduates Do?" (2024/25) Page 77.

¹¹ Community Trade Union, "The Hidden Costs of Student Loans" (2024)

<https://community-tu.org/who-we-are/our-sectors/education-and-early-years/early-career-teachers-ect/university-student-loans-campaign/>

¹² High Fliers 2024, Page 16.

¹³ High Fliers 2024, Page 16.

¹⁴ Institute of Student Employers & Debut, "What do students want? Listening to the voices of young jobseekers" (2020) Page 20.

https://ise.org.uk/global_engine/download.aspx?fileid=0784B0F6-9ACF-48AA-8793-08E17AF84870

¹⁵ "What Do Graduates Do?" (2023/24), Jisc/Prospects/AGCAS, Page 16.

<https://luminare.prospects.ac.uk/what-do-graduates-do>

Demand for Teachers

14. There is a significant demand for teachers within the education sector, however, despite having the youngest teacher workforce in the OECD, the high turnover of younger teachers entering the profession risks causing a top-heavy age profile within the workforce. These challenges have led to long-term problems in other sectors, such as construction, where the older cohorts who make up the majority of the workforce are leaving, and the younger cohorts are not large enough to replace them. Measures such as tackling levels of stress and addressing working conditions within the workforce are key to retaining younger teachers and ensuring that there is a pipeline to meet the needs of the sector in the future.
15. As of November 2023, there were 25,740 teachers in local authority maintained schools across Wales. This is a 2.7% decrease from the previous year.¹⁶ The pupil population has also decreased to one of the lowest populations since 2008. There are now 465,840 pupils attending schools in Wales, with around 2.1% in independent provision.¹⁷
16. Pupil-teacher numbers across mainstream schools remains broadly consistent, however, there continue to be recruitment and retention difficulties in some “*secondary school subject areas, including shortage subjects (such as Welsh, maths, science and modern foreign languages), Welsh-medium schools and schools in areas with high levels of disadvantage.*”¹⁸ And this has led to over 12.5% of vacancies being left unfilled.¹⁹ And where new teachers are recruited, there are not always enough experienced and mature teachers available to nurture the NQTs.
17. Across the 2021-22 academic year, there were 2,292 teaching posts advertised, with over 11% remaining unfilled at the end of the year. 1,340 teachers left the profession during the 2022-23 academic year, of which 360 retired. More concerning is the fact that 27.6% of those who left had less than five years’ experience, leaving a retention issue that risks gaps in provision.
18. This mirrors a UK-wide situation, with *Schools Week* reporting a “*Record rate of teacher departures as 40,000 quit sector last year,*”²⁰ with particular issues amongst those with five years’ service or less.
19. The *Daily Mirror* calls this “*Their Greatest Crisis,*” reporting that in England, 26,443 teachers who qualified in the last five years have already left the job due to “*high workload, persistently under-inflation pay, and the excessive accountability that clogs up teachers’ daily lives.*”²¹

¹⁶ Welsh Government: School Workforce Census results (2024)

<https://www.gov.wales/school-workforce-census-results-november-2023>

¹⁷ Welsh Government: Schools’ Census results (2024)

<https://www.gov.wales/schools-census-results-january-2024>

¹⁸ Anusha Ghosh and Jack Worth, “*Teacher Labour Market in Wales*” Annual Report 2022, NFER. Page 3

https://nfer.ac.uk/media/4zznpvgz/teacher_labour_market_in_wales_annual_report_2022.pdf

¹⁹ Welsh Government: School Workforce Census results (2024)

²⁰ Amy Walker in *Schools Week*, “*Record rate of teacher departures*” (2023)

<https://schoolsweek.co.uk/record-rate-of-teacher-departures-as-40000-leave-sector-last-year/>

²¹ Lucy Thornton & Matt Davies in *The Daily Mirror*, “*One in three teachers quit after just five years as schools face ‘greatest crisis’*” (2023)

<https://www.mirror.co.uk/news/uk-news/one-three-teachers-quit-after-28867577>

20. The latest findings from wave three of *The Working Lives of Teachers and Leaders in England* show that 34% of teachers and leaders were considering leaving the sector in the next 12 months for reasons other than retirement, which is consistent with 2023 and remains much higher than the 25% seen in 2022.²² In Wales, Senedd research²³ suggests 16% of teachers plan on leaving within the next 12 months, but research by NASUWT²⁴ suggests this could be as high as 75%!
21. Either way, high workload and stress and/or poor wellbeing were the two most commonly cited reasons for people leaving the profession. And whilst the evidence from *The Working Lives of Teachers and Leaders* shows this to be a minor decrease in the proportion citing high workload (from 94% in 2023 and 92% in 2022), there has been a notable increase in the proportion citing stress and/or poor wellbeing (from 84% in 2023).²⁵ And, of those who indicated in 2023 that they were considering leaving the sector, 15% actually did so, an increase from 12% in the previous two studies.²⁶
22. Although the number of teachers below age 25 has notably fallen, the average age of teachers across Wales is fairly stable. 2010 figures from the then General Teaching Council for Wales (GTCW) showed the proportion of registered teachers aged under 45 had increased steadily to 57% but Welsh Government data shows that, since then, the highest proportion of teachers in Wales are aged between 30 and 49 (62%) with the number of older teachers also slowly increasing over the last five years.²⁷
23. One of the key aims for Education Wales is attracting and retaining the best and brightest teachers in order to improve life chances and raise standards for all pupils in all areas. And this is expanded by the UK Labour Party in its Opportunity Mission:
*Labour will transform our education system so that young people get the opportunities they deserve. We will expand our childcare and early-years system, drive up standards, modernise the school curriculum, reform assessment, and create higher-quality training and employment paths by empowering local communities to develop the skills people need.*²⁸
24. But this cannot happen without sufficient high-quality staff. NFER agree that there needs to be a long-term strategy and have set out their proposed solutions to the teacher supply issue, including through a meaningful pay uplift to attract new workers to the sector.²⁹ This is particularly pressing in the case of subjects like maths and science where the shortage of teachers is most acute.

²² Working lives of teachers and leaders: Wave 3 Summary report November 2024 (2024) Page 20.

<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/working-lives-of-teachers-and-leaders-wave-3>

²³ Senedd Research "Teaching Matters" (2023)

<https://research.senedd.wales/research-articles/teaching-matters/>

²⁴ Sue Austin in *The Shropshire Star*, "Many Welsh teachers considering leaving the profession, says union" (2023)

<https://www.shropshirestar.com/news/education/2023/04/10/many-welsh-teachers-considering-leaving-the-profession-says-union/>

²⁵ Working lives of teachers and leaders: Wave 3 (2024) Page 20.

²⁶ Statistics Wales: Teacher Characteristics

<https://stats.wales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Schools-and-Teachers/teachers-and-support-staff/school-workforce-annual-census/teachers/teachers-by-staffcategory-agerange>

²⁷ Statistics Wales: Teacher Characteristics

²⁸ The Labour Party Manifesto

<https://labour.org.uk/change/break-down-barriers-to-opportunity/>

²⁹ Jack Worth & Sarah Tang, "Next government needs long-term pay strategy that will help teacher supply challenge" (2024)

https://www.nfer.ac.uk/media/sttdn1mw/next_government_needs_long_term_pay_strategy_that_will_help_teacher_supply_challenge_embargoed.pdf

25. Projections suggest that the demographic ‘bulge’ recently seen in secondary school pupil numbers has now peaked at 161,540 (a 2.3% increase on 2020-21) and will start to slowly decrease over the next few years. Primary pupil numbers have already begun declining, falling 1.5% since 2020-21.³⁰
26. The overall picture suggests a 9.4% reduction in pupil numbers across the UK between 2022 and 2030, with a fall of around 4.5% or 205,000 pupils expected in Wales by 2028.³¹ If managed sensitively, this reduction in demand could serve to alleviate some of the pressures on classroom teacher numbers seen in recent years.
27. These projections are useful to allow us to understand the short to medium-term impact of the changing pupil population, but it is vital that provision is protected and enhanced during times when pupil numbers dip, to ensure that there is ample sufficiency for when additional capacity is needed.

³⁰ Statistics Wales: Pupil Characteristics

<https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Schools-and-Teachers/Schools-Census/Pupil-Level-Annual-School-Census/Pupils/pupils-by-localauthorityregion-agegroup>

³¹ Statistics Wales: Pupil Projections

<https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Schools-and-Teachers/Schools-Census/Pupil-Projections>

Recruitment & Retention

28. The Welsh Government and Education Wales strode ahead of England and Northern Ireland in pushing for a starting salary for teachers of £30,000. This has since risen to £32,433, but teachers continue to leave the sector, with a 2.7% increase in 2023.
29. The current programme of work being undertaken to boost the number of trainees into ITT failed to produce any notable impact prior to the pandemic, and subsequent figures suggest that recruitment has “fallen further for shortage subjects such as maths, science, and Welsh to meet less than half of the recruitment targets. Recruitment to modern foreign languages (MFL) and geography ITE courses increased in 2019/20 but continued to remain substantially below target.”³²
30. Demand for additional learning needs (ALN) provision continues to rise exponentially, yet dedicated funding for pupils such as the Pupil Development Grant (PDG), for example, has not kept pace with overall inflation. The system is broken.
31. And to compound this, the graduate age population, from which a significant proportion of new teachers are recruited, is forecast to shrink over coming years, making recruitment even more challenging.
32. Community believe there is a need for coherence across the teachers’ pay system in Wales, providing simplification and standardisation that can be applied to all teachers and school leaders in Wales.
33. As the EEF notes: “*The best available evidence indicates that great teaching is the most important lever schools have to improve pupil attainment,*”³³ so what can be done to recruit and retain the brightest and best?
34. We have mentioned in previous responses the need for a personal entitlement to continuing professional development. Comparing the situation in Wales with other high-performing nations highlights significant differences. “*In Singapore, teachers have a right to 100 hours a year of professional development (Parliament 2014), yet in Wales teachers rarely experience 30 hours of high-quality training a year through INSET days. This must change if we want a genuinely world-class schooling system.*”³⁴
35. According to TES, schools spend around £3,000 per teacher per year on CPD, but too much CPD is poor quality, poorly delivered and not suitable for all staff.³⁵ Feedback from the *Working Lives of Teachers and Leaders* report in England agrees, with 16% stating that the CPD they had undertaken had little or no impact.³⁶
36. According to EPI,³⁷ a formal entitlement to 35 hours of high quality CPD a year would boost pupil attainment by an extra two-thirds of a GCSE grade – which in turn translates to extra lifetime earnings of over £6,000 per pupil.

³² “*Teacher Labour Market in Wales*” Annual Report 2022. Page 13

³³ Harry Quilter-Pinner et al., “*Out of Kilter – How to rebalance our school system to work for people, economy and society*” (September 2023). Institute for Public Policy Research, Page 29.

<https://www.ippr.org/research/publications/out-of-kilter>

³⁴ “*Out of Kilter – How to rebalance our school system to work for people, economy and society*”, Page 30.

³⁵ Matilda Martin in TES, “*Just 4 in 10 teachers found their last Inset day useful*” (2024)

<https://www.tes.com/magazine/news/general/just-4-10-teachers-found-last-inset-day-useful-cpd>

³⁶ Working Lives of Teachers and Leaders – Wave 1 Core Report (2023) Page 22.

<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/working-lives-of-teachers-and-leaders-wave-1>

³⁷ Jens Van Den Brande, “*The effects of high-quality professional development on teachers and students: A cost-benefit analysis*”

37. Furthermore, a policy of CPD entitlement could also significantly improve retention, leading to up to an estimated 12,000 extra teachers remaining in the profession a year.
38. Community feel that it is within the remit of The Review Body to mandate professional development through teachers' pay and conditions. This could be achieved through a system that provides individualised and meaningful development opportunities, as well as the necessary institutional training, such as safeguarding. We feel this would re-energise and empower teachers to ensure that they had the skills they felt important to address the issues they experience in classrooms every day.

Matters for Recommendation

Pay

39. Data from the Office for National Statistics (ONS) shows that, across Great Britain, annual growth in employees' average regular earnings (excluding bonuses) was 4.9%, covering the period June to August 2024. The last time that growth was lower than this was in April to June 2022, when it was 4.7%.³⁸ This means that last year's teacher pay award was only marginally higher than average annual wage growth, and would have been lower if the recommendation of the IWPRB had been carried forward without the no-detriment adjustment.
40. Despite recent pay awards, it is evident that teacher pay is lower than it should be had it kept pace with inflation and the wider economy. Indeed, the gap between teachers and other graduate pay continues to widen, being, according to ONS data, 10.75% lower than it was in 2009.³⁹
41. The pay rise for 2024-25 put real-terms pay for new teachers at about the same level as 2010, and "roughly matches" recent growth in private sector wages, the Institute for Fiscal Studies said in its public sector pay report.⁴⁰ And yet teachers and other public sector occupations have fallen further down the pay distribution scale, even when their usually more generous employer pension contributions are taken into account.⁴¹
42. The Review Body agrees, commenting that *"teachers saw large reductions in average real pay from 2010 to 2019 (falling 13%)"*.⁴² And although, salary points may have risen by over 11% (consolidated) in the last two years, data shows that *"prices in March 2023 were 18% higher than two years earlier"*.⁴³
43. This has resulted in teacher and school leader pay being around 22% lower in real terms than in 2010 when measured against Retail Prices Index (RPI) inflation. It is vital that this damage to teacher and school leader pay and conditions is repaired to fix the recruitment and retention crisis.
44. In order to combat this, *"salary levels need to be sufficiently competitive to attract the best graduates to the profession"*.⁴⁴ In the private sector, annual average total earnings growth was 4.7% with average regular earnings growth for the public sector dropping to 5.2% in June to August 2024, down on the previous three-month period (5.7%).⁴⁵ Therefore, in order to even remain competitive, teacher pay must at least match these annual rises.
45. Therefore, Community call on The Review Body to make a 7% uplift to teacher pay rates to begin to close this gap.

³⁸ ONS - Average weekly earnings in Great Britain (October 2024)

<https://www.ons.gov.uk/employmentandlabourmarket/peopleinwork/employmentandemployeetypes/bulletins/averageweeklyearningsingreatbritain/october2024>

³⁹ "Average weekly earnings in Great Britain" (December 2023) Office for National Statistics Bulletin

<https://www.ons.gov.uk/employmentandlabourmarket/peopleinwork/employmentandemployeetypes/bulletins/averageweeklyearningsingreatbritain/latest>

⁴⁰ Jonathan Cribb et al. "Pressures on public sector pay", Institute for Fiscal Studies (September 2024)

<https://ifs.org.uk/publications/pressures-public-sector-pay>

⁴¹ Jasmine Norden in TES "Experienced teacher pay 9% below 2010 levels despite rise" (2024)

<https://www.tes.com/magazine/news/general/experienced-teacher-pay-below-2010-levels-despite-rise>

⁴² Independent Welsh Pay Review Body, 5th Report, (2024). Paragraph 6.24, page 83.

<https://www.gov.wales/independent-welsh-pay-review-body-fifth-report-2024>

⁴³ School Teachers' Review Body for England, 33rd Report, (2023). Paragraph 3.9, page 15.

<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/school-teachers-review-body-33rd-report-2023>

⁴⁴ IWPRB (2024). Paragraph 6.16, page 82.

⁴⁵ ONS - Average weekly earnings in Great Britain (October 2024)

46. We need a funding settlement that matches current levels of demand on schools and colleges. We need more support for our struggling local services, and we must ensure there is sufficient financial resource for schools to provide high quality education and support to children and young people.⁴⁶
47. Schools must receive additional funds from the Department to cover the costs of any recommendation. Failure to provide this will exacerbate the funding crisis in our schools and will lead to further restructuring and redundancies. Most importantly, it will not improve conditions for staff and will harm the outcomes for pupils.
48. Despite rumour mongering, evidence strongly suggests that teacher pay awards have little impact on the wider economy, with the governor of the Bank of England dismissing concerns raised by the Conservatives that Labour's plans for public sector pay rises would risk stoking inflation and keep interest rates higher for longer.⁴⁷
49. Mr Bailey stated that, *"private sector wage developments ... [tend]... to "lead" the public sector, rather than the other way around."* Going on to note that *"pay awards of 5-6% would have a relatively small impact on headline inflation."*⁴⁸
50. We support the independent Welsh Pay Review Body to feel empowered to make the recommendations needed to reverse the real-terms pay cuts since 2010, restore pay competitiveness and tackle the workload problems. It is then for the Welsh Government to make, and be accountable for, the political choices on the investment needed to repair the damage to pay, conditions and supply.

Progression, Threshold and Allowances

51. Another step that could be taken to address this issue of retention for experienced teachers is to look again at the artificial barrier of threshold.
52. Originally, the Upper Pay Scale was introduced to offer an alternative career path to teachers who worked to stay in the classroom rather than to go into management and leadership roles. Essentially, the difference between a teacher at the beginning of their career and a teacher paid on the Upper Pay Scale is one of skill and experience. And yet, feedback from our members is that, in many schools, additional tasks and increased workload are an expectation of "UPS teachers." This was not the original intention.
53. Unhelpfully, there appears to be a blurring of the distinction in many instances between Upper Pay Scale and Teaching and Learning Responsibilities. To be clear, an experienced teacher who is paid on the Upper Pay Scale does not have to be a subject leader, nor have additional pastoral duties. Similarly, the National Teacher Standards⁴⁹ do not specify additional or expanded expectations just because a teacher is paid on the Upper Pay Scale.

⁴⁶ "Teacher Wellbeing Index" (2023). Page 59

https://www.educationsupport.org.uk/media/0h4jd5pt/twix_2023.pdf

⁴⁷ Richard Partington in *The Guardian*, "Bank of England dismisses Tory claims" (2024)

<https://www.theguardian.com/society/article/2024/aug/01/bank-of-england-dismisses-tory-claims-public-sector-pay-rises-will-stoke-inflation>

⁴⁸ *The Guardian*, "Bank of England dismisses Tory claims" (2024)

⁴⁹ DfE: Teacher Standards Overview

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/5a750668ed915d3c7d529cad/Teachers_standard_information.pdf

54. As a result of this confusion, we see some merit in a reconsideration of the two pay scales and a possible merging of the Main and Upper Pay Scales. This would remove the somewhat artificial barrier of threshold and open up the higher end of the salary scale to all classroom teachers, improving the retention of experience. It could also present a more attractive career structure to potential and current teachers. And, as IES evidence states, so *“many teachers and leaders are unclear about the requirements for progression to the UPR and the expectations of those working at the UPR” that the structure is ripe for reform.*⁵⁰
55. There is similar confusion over the role and deployment of Teaching and Learning Responsibility (TLR) and Additional Learning Needs (ALN) allowances, which do not appear to be utilised in smaller schools due to a lack of funding, meaning some teachers are carrying a sizeable management burden without being properly recompensed.
56. Currently, allowances such as TLRs apply to the whole of a teacher's salary and are pro-rated if that individual works part time. The system assumes that the duties are the responsibility of someone else during that teacher's absence, but increasingly, teachers are assuming whole school duties for which they are the sole person responsible, whilst also working part time. Jack Dyson notes in *Schools Week* that in England this has contributed to *“unhealthy flexible working arrangements where people haven't been fairly remunerated for the job they're doing.”*⁵¹ In short, teachers may be discriminated against because of their chosen working pattern.
57. Community would support changes to the pay document to allow the full value of a TLR or ALN allowance to be paid to a teacher who has sole responsibility, regardless of their working time.

Workload and Wellbeing

58. Schools are places of education and learning, but they are also places of trust and, increasingly, places of help and support where food is provided, and where people feel safe. The withdrawal of vital social support services and provision has pushed additional duties onto school leaders, teachers and support staff, increasing their workload and having a detrimental impact on their ability to prioritise the job they were employed for, which is damaging to job satisfaction and personal wellbeing.
59. Community believe that the current terms and conditions – which place no cap or limit of any kind on teacher or school leader workload, is having a damaging impact on the physical and mental wellbeing of the workforce, and that this needs to be investigated as a health and safety risk.
60. This is particularly notable for school leaders, who regularly worked an average of 56.6 hours per week in 2024. While this is a minor decrease from 57.4 per week in 2023, and consistent with 56.8 in 2022, this level of workload remains both excessively high and unsustainable.

⁵⁰ Anneka Dawson et al. *Teachers', leaders' and governors' views on the pay framework* (2018) Page 28.
https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/5f57bdb6e90e07146161d45b/Teachers_Pay_Framework_RR854.pdf

⁵¹ Jack Dyson in *Schools Week*. “The trailblazer schools already flexing TLR payments” (2024)
<https://schoolsweek.co.uk/teacher-pay-the-trailblazer-schools-already-flexing-tlr-payments/>

61. As we have reported previously, The World Health Organization noted⁵² that long working hours are a significant contributor to deaths from heart disease and stroke. Between 2000 and 2016, the number of deaths from heart disease due to working long hours increased by 42%, and from stroke by 19%. And yet, the number of people working long hours continues to increase.⁵³ *“Working 55 hours or more per week is a serious health hazard... [and] long working hours can lead to premature death.”*⁵⁴
62. *The Working Lives of Teachers and Leaders* study goes on to report that teachers recorded fewer working hours on average than leaders, and also reported slightly lower working hours than in 2022 or 2023 (51.9 in 2022, 52.4 in 2023, 51.2 in 2024) but again these are excessively high when measured against the 1,265 hours that form directed time.⁵⁵
63. The *Teacher Wellbeing Index* and the UK Department for Education’s *The Working Lives of Teachers and Leaders* report both agree that there are major issues with workload leading to stress, exhaustion and burnout.
64. In addition to pay, we need to consider the workload and wellbeing aspects of teaching as a priority. *“The 2021 national education workforce survey highlighted the continued challenge of unmanageable workload for school-teachers and school leaders (EWC, 2021). Indeed, the survey suggested that school-teachers were working more hours in 2021 than they were in 2016. Progress with reducing teacher workload would likely help to improve teacher retention.”*⁵⁶
65. Mental Health UK found that, in the past year, one in nine UK adults had experienced high levels of stress that contributed to them also taking time off work during that period.⁵⁷
66. 34% of teachers and leaders in England surveyed⁵⁸, and 16% of their counterparts in Wales⁵⁹ indicated that they were considering leaving the sector in the next 12 months for reasons other than retirement, with high workload and stress and/or poor wellbeing being the two most commonly cited reasons (both reported by 90%). And in Wales, 4% of teachers left last year for reasons other than retirement, the highest number in over a decade.
67. This high-pressure toll has led to just less than half of teachers and leaders feeling satisfied with their job, with the proportion who enjoyed teaching most or all of the time decreasing from 84% in 2022 to 78% in just two years.⁶⁰

⁵² World Health Organization / International Labour Organization, “Long working hours increasing deaths from heart disease and stroke” (2021)

<https://www.who.int/news/item/17-05-2021-long-working-hours-increasing-deaths-from-heart-disease-and-stroke-who-ilo>

⁵³ Frank Pega et al, “Global, regional, and national burdens of ischemic heart disease and stroke attributable to exposure to long working hours for 194 countries, 2000–2016: A systematic analysis from the WHO/ILO”

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0160412021002208>

⁵⁴ WHO / ILO “Long working hours increasing deaths from heart disease and stroke” (2021)

⁵⁵ Working lives of teachers and leaders: Wave 3 (2024) Page 6.

⁵⁶ “Teacher Labour Market in Wales” Annual Report 2022. Page 17

⁵⁷ Philip Inman in *The Guardian* “UK unemployment falls as wages growth hits lowest in two years” (2024)

<https://www.theguardian.com/business/article/2024/aug/13/uk-unemployment-falls-wages-growth-inflation>

⁵⁸ Working lives of teachers and leaders: Wave 3 (2024) Page 20.

⁵⁹ Senedd Research “Teaching Matters” (2023)

⁶⁰ Working lives of teachers and leaders: Wave 3 (2024) Page 15.

68. According to Dr Robin Bevan one of the most important ways to relieve workload stress is to avoid unplanned additional tasks. Given that teachers are required to follow a timetabled week and to deliver lessons based on a prerequisite curriculum, the amount of unplanned additional tasks should be minimal, but the reality is that too many things are demanded at the last minute, preventing even the best organised individual from effectively discharging their duties.
69. We need to ensure that every school has a directed time calendar that maps out training, meetings and parents' evenings with sufficient leeway to account for unforeseen issues, such as inspection. And strategies to programme meetings and other directed-time activities, considering both the spread throughout the year and also the volume and impact of that work, should be a requirement rather than simply good practice. This would support part-time workers and be more family friendly.
70. We are pleased to see the School Teachers' Pay and Conditions (Wales) Document include the list of administrative duties and tasks list in Annex 3 and specifically reference them in Part 7 – Contractual framework for teachers. This list is the first step in recognising that there is a limit to what teachers can be required to carry out. It is important to recognise that this is an illustrative list, but we recommend that teachers, leaders and governing bodies use this as a guide to question the validity of all tasks, be they carried out by teachers or other staff. It may be necessary for the specific circumstances of the workplace to be taken into account as this duty is likely to weigh more heavily on small primary schools which should be afforded further support as necessary.
71. We recommend schools carry out an audit to consider the following questions:
1. Does the task need to be done at all?
 2. Can it be done by administrative or non-teaching staff?
 3. Does it require the skills and knowledge of a qualified teacher to carry out?
72. As a result, schools can specify who is responsible for carrying out the tasks, making effective use of their workforce, and, where necessary, amending contracts and pay to reflect and recognise the additional responsibilities.
73. Identifying unnecessary tasks is important, but all tasks will require time to complete. Therefore, it is vital every teacher is guaranteed planning, preparation and assessment (PPA) time as well as additional time to fulfil any leadership duties they may have.⁶¹ And the Review Body agreed in its 4th Report that *"workload arising from non-contact tasks such as administrative and clerical tasks, PPA time, cover supervision and its management, examination invigilation, staff absence definition and management of staff absence, leadership and management time and the provision of school calendars" all needed much more clarity.*⁶²

⁶¹ Dr Robin Bevan in TES *"How to spread out your teaching workload"* (2024)
<https://www.tes.com/magazine/sponsored/dfe/how-spread-out-your-teaching-workload>

⁶² IWPRB 4th Report (2022) Paragraph 6.25
<https://www.gov.wales/independent-welsh-pay-review-body-fourth-report-2022>

74. As we have cited in previous submissions, evidence from schools that have already implemented an approach to increase PPA, such as Noel-Baker Academy in Derby, show the benefits that can be achieved by giving staff 20% of timetabled time for PPA. Although the potential cost implications for such a move could be significant⁶³, the study found that the corresponding increase in teacher wellbeing drastically reduced staff absence and associated supply teacher costs. Former Headteacher Ann Donaghy commented: *"Permanent staff [are] much cheaper and better for the children in terms of stability and quality of provision."* And in turn, this leads to *"improved pupil outcomes, bettering our teaching staff recruitment and retention, and giving us time to invest in really well-thought-out extracurricular provisions"*.⁶⁴
75. Finally, as we highlighted in our evidence last year, the right to disconnect is important and it is something which is easy for the Review Body to recommend for inclusion in future publications of the STPC(W)D.
76. The right to disconnect was signed into law in France in 2017. Whilst we appreciate that the Review Body does not have such authority, we do believe that it is time to reflect on the working hours of teachers and leaders.
77. Teachers are already restricted from working directed time at weekends or at lunchtimes. A strengthening of this wording, and the inclusion of a right to disconnect at weekends and during school closure periods, would be greatly appreciated by the sector and would be a starting point for addressing the wider workload issues. We recommend the Review Body consider the model adopted in Scotland, where teachers have a 35-hour working week teaching no more than 18½ hours, as a potential model for Wales.

⁶³ The 5.5% pay award for teachers in England for 2024 cost an additional £56m. The 2024 pay award for both teachers and support staff in Wales cost an additional £1.1m therefore it is reasonable to assume that to increase PPA time to 20%, an increase of 10%, could cost around £2m if other savings were not realised.

⁶⁴ Grainne Hallahan in TES, *"Why doubling PPA could help tackle the attainment gap"* (2021)
<https://www.tes.com/magazine/teaching-learning/general/why-doubling-ppa-could-help-tackle-attainment-gap>

Summary

78. The national mission of high standards and aspirations proclaimed by the Welsh Government is an ambitious goal, and one that can only be achieved with a robust recruitment and retention strategy. Community is pleased that The Department has been working with the sector to realise this, but more still needs to be done.
79. Community suggest that a robust investigation of the impact of the merger of the Main Pay Scale and the Upper Pay Scale be undertaken prior to a merger into one pay scale. Merging the classroom teacher pay scales would support aspiration and have a positive impact, particularly on female teachers, who often suffer from lower pay as they disproportionately remain in the classroom. We also believe that this unified pay scale would remove the confusion around, and misuse of the Upper Pay Scale
80. Currently, teacher pay lags at around 22% of 2010 levels (when measured against RPI) which is having a detrimental impact on recruitment and retention, especially in areas of high cost-of-living. Community recommend a pay award of 7% across all salary points, allowances and responsibility payments. Given that average earnings growth in the private sector stands at 6%, we feel this would be in line with the wider employment market.
81. But whilst this pay award is desperately needed by teachers and leaders across the length and breadth of Wales, it cannot come at the detriment of support staff roles, wider support services within the local authority and other jobs within the education sector. Therefore, it is essential that it is fully funded by the Welsh Government and calculated to support employers so that no school is left financially vulnerable by a national decision.
82. Community also recommend improvements to working conditions, including a mandatory directed time calendar in each school and support to reduce working hours as recommended in the workload reduction annex. And the right to disconnect – especially for senior leaders who should not be expected to be always available every weekend and throughout school closure periods.
83. Finally, as has been noted in our previous submissions to the Review Body, Community recommend a pathway be developed to increase PPA in schools from 10% to 20% over time to support teacher and Support Staff workload and wellbeing. We suggest two pilots take place, one with PPA at 15% and one with PPA at 20% to gather robust evidence to understand and analyse the impact this would make to the lived experiences of our school staff.

Remit Letter

Lynne Neagle AS/MS
Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros Addysg
Cabinet Secretary for Education



Our ref: MALN0212/25
Mrs Sharon Lusher
Chair
Independent Welsh Pay Review Body
C/o:
Secretariat
Independent Welsh Pay Review Body
Secretariat@iwprb.wales

27 January 2025

SCHOOL TEACHERS' PAY AND CONDITIONS YEAR 6 REMIT: MATTERS FOR REPORT

Dear Sharon,

I would like to take this opportunity to first of all thank you once again for your work and that of the Independent Welsh Pay Review Body (IWPRB) in providing us with both your strategic review report and your fifth report into Teachers' Pay and Conditions in Wales. Together these reports have provided detailed insight on issues at the time and through your recommendations provided very useful potential resolutions. As you know, we have been able to increase teachers' pay by 5.5% this year and provide an additional £5m for ALNCoS, alongside our commitment to progress work on recommendations 4-7 in the context of the review of the ALN Code over the coming months. We expect to set out next steps on this by summer 2025.

Throughout recent years we have seen the teaching profession in Wales face a number of significant challenges. I am pleased that since the devolution of powers over teachers' pay and conditions here in Wales, we have been able to address a number of the concerns of the profession. These have been achieved through the partnership working of all key stakeholders alongside the very helpful reports and recommendations received from the IWPRB.

I am mindful of the conclusions and recommendations of your Strategic Review of the structure of Teachers' and Leaders' pay and conditions in Wales (April 2024) and your Review of the roles and responsibilities of supply teachers in Wales employed through local authorities or directly by schools (April 2024). I am also aware of the Public Accounts and Public Administration Committee report on Supply and Demand: covering teacher absence (December 2024).

Canolfan Cyffwrdd Cymru / First Point of Contact Centre:
0200 900400
Gobeithiau.Lynne.Neagle@iwprb.wales
Correspondence.Lynne.Neagle@iwprb.wales

Bae Caerdydd - Cardiff Bay
Caerdydd - Cardiff
CF99 1DN

Rydym yn croeso i derbyn gobeithiau yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gobeithiau a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gobeithiau yn Gymraeg yn arwain at ddiwedd.
We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

Matters for Recommendation

I refer to the IWPRB the following matters for recommendation in light of the considerations above:

- What adjustments should be made to the salary and allowance ranges for classroom teachers, unqualified teachers and school leaders, to ensure the teaching profession in Wales is promoted and rewarded to encourage recruitment and retention of high-quality practitioners.

In order to allow maximum time for consideration of, and consultation on, your recommendations, I require you provide a report to me by no later than 21 May 2025.

- Following submission of the May report: What adjustments should be made to Leaders' Conditions of Service and in particular the consideration of whether guaranteed working hours (or limits on) as well as protected holiday entitlement and weekends for leaders be included in the STPC(W/D).

As the work progresses on approach to previous recommendations, it may be that we add elements to this remit as part of our commitment to move towards a multi-year rolling workplan.

I look forward to receiving your recommendations on these matters.

Lynne Neagle AS/MS
Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet dros Addysg
Cabinet Secretary for Education

Alongside this, I am aware, as you are, of the reform programme and the impact that it is having on the need for high quality professional learning, the wider need to support teacher wellbeing and address workload, support leaders and all school staff. I have recently confirmed my commitment to work with all partners to develop an education workforce strategic plan which seeks to recognise the professionalism and quality of our teachers and school staff in support of our learners, promote wellbeing, recruitment and retention, and improve the quality of teaching and learning.

In this context, I consider it important that we agree a timeline and implementation plan for the key issues that the IWPRB and related reports have raised on pay and conditions, and ensure we are clear and transparent on the timeline and work needed to progress these. I am also mindful of the challenging financial landscape and workload both within local authorities and schools.

In 2025, Government officials will be working closely with the Pay Partnership Forum or subgroups thereof to support development of a prioritised plan around the range of existing pay and conditions recommendations for the staff that the IWPRB has responsibility for. I expect this to begin with the recommendations in the Strategic Review which are most immediate in terms of timeline and priority – specifically teachers' working times, workload and pay scale – and expect the proposals on these to report by September 2025.

I am very grateful for the work of the IWPRB and the effort that you as the Chair, and your Board, put in on an ongoing basis, and particularly whilst the work to confirm the secretariat arrangements for the coming year are being put in place. It is a high priority for us to ensure that you have appropriate support and that there is a strong and sustainable solution going forward.

For 2025/26, I expect that the Independent Welsh Pay Review Body should have particular regard to:

- the need to ensure consistent and reasonable pay arrangements which encourage teacher professionalism together with supporting recruitment and retention of sufficient quality and quantity of teachers and leaders;
- recruitment and retention data;
- wider economic and labour market conditions, including the public sector financial context;
- identification of cost of any proposed changes to pay and conditions;
- a need for coherence across the teachers' pay system in Wales, providing simplification and standardisation that can be applied to all teachers and school leaders in Wales.

The IWPRB must also have regard to relevant legal obligations of relevant bodies, particularly equalities legislation relating to: age, disability, sex, marital status, sexual orientation, gender reassignment, race, religion or belief, or pregnancy and maternity.