



WRITTEN SUBMISSION TO

THE INDEPENDENT WELSH PAY REVIEW BODY

March 2022

Community Union Voice Section
Pembroke House,
20 Cathedral Road,
Cardiff,
CF11 9LJ

In Autumn 2020, Voice – the Union for Education Professionals became a distinct section of Community Union. The Voice Section of Community Trade Union (hereafter referred to as Voice Community), represents teachers, lecturers, tutors, school support staff, early years and childcare professionals in all workplaces and across the UK.

Roy Rickhuss, General Secretary of Community said:

“Community always looks forwards to contributing to the teachers’ pay review. This year, we will use our contribution to highlight our members experiences - as collected for our report into ‘The Future of Education’. We are hopeful the board listen to those experiences and bring forwards a pay proposal that meets our members expectations.

For too long, teachers have been experiencing a real-terms pay cut, additional stress from significant amounts of administration combined with not enough PPA time and a chronic lack of training and development. It is essential the review board tackle these issues if we are to stop the high levels of attrition and maintain experienced teachers in the sector.”

Introduction: Education Staff throughout this Pandemic

- 1. Unions submission to the IWRPB have consistently noted that ongoing pay restraint is continuing to fail in incentivising high calibre excellent and experienced teachers to remain in the profession. Pay and workload continue to be the determining factors in recruitment and retention of high calibre education staff when being weighed against other attractive opportunities.*
- 2. The Pandemic is now at the end of its second year and schools and teachers and pupils have continued to bear a large impact of the COVID 19 crisis. Staff absences across the education sector have increased the stress of working in this unpredictable environment, and whilst we are now reaching an endemic stage where loss of life is less the driving risk factor, illness and the need for self-isolation continue to affect staff presence in school.*
- 3. Teachers and teaching assistants cite workload as the main reason for leaving the profession. The increased workload during the pandemic stretched staff in both time commitment and the learning of new skills to provide blended learning. Staff have had no time to prepare for the New Curriculum, nor for the ALN Act 2018. The Welsh Government Managing Wellbeing and Reducing Bureaucracy Group have examined the issue of the impact of workload on staff, and discussions have*

been held on the need for Welsh Government to assess the workload impact of new policies before the implementation stage. Both the New Curriculum and the ALN Act are examples of an unassessed workload impact on staff, both are being implemented at a time when the staff are exhausted, where there is no slack in the system to be utilised. Yet both policies rely on the capacity and capability of the staff on the ground.

- 4. Calls for investment in the education sector are strong, to address recovery and the unequitable impact of remote learning on children living in poverty or with ALN, to provide for implementation of the new education policies, and to address the overwhelming workload that staff carry.*
- 5. COVID 19 has highlighted the integrated nature of the education team delivering learning in educational settings. There is a strong recognition of the invaluable role of the Teaching Assistants in schools, they stepped up to changes in their roles necessary to keep classes still running. Going forward Voice Community would call for an end to the two-tier system in the approach to pay and conditions of teaching assistants and teachers.*
- 6. Voice Community calls for investment in an increased staff recruitment, which is needed to deliver the quality teaching able to activate recovery from the crisis, and provide the supportive learning environment our school children and young people need.*
- 7. With these demands in mind Voice Community urgently calls for a pay increase of 10% across the board, immediate steps to address the main driver of attrition named by teachers leaving the profession as an increasing and unsustainable workload by increasing the PPA from 10% to 20% and investing by increasing the numbers of teachers employed in schools to provide for that allocation’.*
- 8. We are committed to working productively with the IWPRB, the Welsh Government and with other stakeholders on matters relating to teachers’ pay and conditions. We welcome the opportunity to submit written evidence to the Independent Welsh Pay Review Body (“IWPRB”) in the fourth year since teachers’ pay and conditions have been devolved to Wales, in response to the remit from the Minister for education and Welsh Language to the IWPRB dated January 2022 (“the Remit”).*
- 9. In submitting evidence, we agree with the Minister for Education and Welsh Language ‘ Throughout the past 18 months, we have seen the teaching profession provide tremendous professionalism, flexibility and resilience as Schools in Wales have adapted to new ways of working during the pandemic, reflecting the excellent teaching workforce we have here in Wales.*
- 10. It is important that the next steps we take provide us with further opportunities to develop a distinct national system in Wales. This will not only improve and enhance our current system, but it will also help us achieve a fairer and more*

transparent system for all teachers.'

11. We welcome the emphasis on the need for a fairer and more transparent system for all teachers and would also hope to see that approach extended to the whole Education staff team. Teacher numbers have decreased year on year, with a larger impact in disadvantaged areas. To address this established trend, we need to include a significant pay award as well as substantial measures to address workload.

Background

Current climate

12. In last year's submission Voice Community referred to the then Minister for Education comments on the impact of COVID 19 on disadvantaged children. The Minister also highlighted the disproportionate impact of lockdown on those disadvantaged children who 'could have fallen up to 75% behind their more affluent peers' (The Welsh Agenda IWA Publication Autumn/Winter 2020 (1)). This impact is further reported this year with an increased attainment gap between advantaged and disadvantaged learners. COVID 19 has exacerbated inequalities worldwide. In Wales 29% of children live in relative income poverty, 18% are entitled to free School meals. There is a 16% educational attainment gap for children at age 11 in poorer compared to more well-off backgrounds (Education response to C19 – implications for schools (2)).
13. A rapid impact assessment done by the Educational Endowment Fund (3) estimates that the gap due to closures will have widened by between 11% to 75% for children in England which is likely to be the same for Wales.
14. The trauma and emotional impact of the pandemic on our school children and young people will need further support from teachers to ensure a successful transition in overcoming this trauma. Fuel poverty will worsen and impact pupils' ability to learn and remain healthy. In this environment investment in the teaching profession is even more a vital part of any recovery for learners and for the economy and country.
15. The economic impact of the pandemic will affect everyone, but we know some are more affected than others and the low paid are particularly hit by COVID 19 (OECD Education at a Glance 2021 (4)). The Guardian 2nd January 2022 (5) predicted that the global economy will gain momentum in 2021 to 6.9%, but fall off in 2022 to 4.7%. The UK economy was within touching distance of the pre pandemic level at .05% below its February 2020 level in October 2021, current impacts on the economy are a continuing uncertainty over Omicron, additional challenges to people and businesses from rising prices and supply bottlenecks. Inflation is at its highest for a decade. The Bank of England has announced that the CPI December 2021 was at 4.8%. predicted to be 6% by April 2022, whilst RPI is 7.5% at January 2022.
16. In the immediate future the pressures on the public purse are myriad. The NHS has backlogs of operations as well as ongoing care for people experiencing

serious threats due to COVID 19, intense pressure will be felt by businesses and individuals when the fuel caps are lifted. Government response to these pressures could lead to diminished funds available to support education. Although disadvantaged students have had the hardest time adjusting to distance learning, spending on education may be under threat in this coming year (OECD 2020 (6)), state that there is compelling evidence that the calibre of teachers is the most significant in school determinants of student achievements. This translates into a need to recruit the top talent to education. The challenge ahead is huge.

17. Since compensation and working conditions are important for attracting, developing and retaining high-quality skilled teachers and headteachers, it is important for policy makers to carefully consider teachers' salaries and career prospects as they try to secure both high quality teaching and education budgets (OECD 2020 (6)). Luke Sibieta has commented 'it is astounding that teacher pay levels remain so far below what they were before the financial crisis. To stop the problems (of recruitment) getting worse the Government(s) (UK) will need to provide above inflation (*pay increases*) from 2022 onwards. Unless the salaries of experienced teachers grow by 13% in cash terms over the next two year they will still be lower in real terms than in 2007' (Teacher Shortages in England (7)).
18. Voice Community, whilst acknowledging the pressure on budgets, recognises it is most important for the future of our school children and the nation, that the pivotal role of education in economic recovery is kept as a priority in financial decision making as we go ahead. Human capital plays a central role in a country's economic development. Education is a pre-condition of economic growth, ignoring this would endanger the prosperity of future generations with widespread repercussions for poverty, social exclusion and sustainability of social security systems (Woessman 2015 (8)). OECD 2021 (4) have commented that children need to aspire and acquire to degree at 2 (I) to make significant contributions to society.
19. UNESCO 2012 (9) identified that for every £1 spent on education, £10 to £15 can be generated in economic growth. Keeping education, a priority for the nation is vital in a post pandemic recovery plan. But this is not about 'merely years of schooling but the quality of teaching (reflected in international examinations) that has a significant relationship with economic growth'. (Hanushek et al 2010 (10)). Voice Community would strongly support this emphasis on the quality of teaching which stems from the intrinsic values which draw and retain people in the profession: the sense of making a difference, of holding professional pride, of belonging to a community and working collegiality. These values embed a belonging which build resilience, stability, and a future security in our education profession (Chiong, C 2020 (11)).
20. Education has a strategic link and importance to economic recovery. Voice Community last year demanded 1.75% and was pleased the Welsh Government agreed to this. This was not in recognition of their work, and in no way reflects the level deserved by our dedicated and professional educational staff who have gone beyond any expectations in their efforts to ensure learners were provided

with learning opportunities. Last year's award did not compensate for the years of cuts to teachers' pay.

21. Voice Community last year raised the need to address retention issues for more experienced teachers. Their retention in lead practitioner and leadership roles is crucial for that maintenance of a supportive culture which embeds NQTs in the school community. A strong school professional network and culture enhances the likelihood of NQTs staying in the profession beyond the 0-5 years of high risk of attrition. The lack of demonstration of value for this experienced teacher group is an oversight which fails to recognise the pivotal role the experienced teacher plays in retaining NQTs and early career teachers (Education at a glance OECD (4)) comments that salary evolves at a slower rate and is less attractive to older teachers than opportunities in other industries.
22. This group of teachers also create the most impact on learner development especially for those pupils experiencing disadvantage – the quality impact referred to earlier. The IWRPB's third report noted that progression after 15 years in teaching was limited. All education unions have called for a clearer career progression as a factor in retention of more experienced teachers. We believe that the increasing reduction in differentials within and between pay ranges indicates that more senior teachers and senior leaders will not feel valued in the essential role that they play in the education system in Wales, and that this may lead to further disincentives for teachers to progress to senior leadership roles. This is already a matter of concern and is going to get worse unless senior teachers and senior leaders receive proper and proportionate pay increases. The Welsh Government also need to consider the very real beliefs held by teachers which impact on motivation and retention. According to the NASUWT report 2019 81% of teachers believed their salary was not competitive, and 73% believed they were not paid commensurate with their skills (A review of schoolteachers pay in England compared with other graduate professions IDR 2019 (12)).
23. In the existing environment where teacher pay has fallen behind the market in real terms the resilience of teachers to remain in the industry is on a knife edge. Pay has been decreasing for decades, and the pattern of pay review in England has been associated with a worsening teacher recruitment and retention particularly since 2015. For teachers on the upper pay scale the levels have decreased by 8% in real terms 2007 to 2021, and for those on the main scale the decrease has been between 4% and 5% over the same period (Teachers Shortages in England EPI 2020 (13)). In comparison average earning over the whole economy has risen by .6% in real terms since 2007. Union submissions 2021/22 all emphasised the impact of workload, a number of whom asked for the PPA to be increased to 20%. No concrete recommendations came from the IWRPBs 3rd Report on this matter. There is broad acknowledgment that workload affects the recruitment and retention of teachers and leaders, some concrete actions on this matter would go far to boost morale of an exhausted staff, particularly in the current COVID 19 context.

24. It is noted that the issue of how TLRs are implemented across and within schools is problematic, and we would like to remind the IWPRB that our comments on this aspect last year were that in areas where discretion has play, a gender imbalance can occur. We acknowledge the IWRPB recommendation that Local Authorities pay more attention to gender monitoring and the use of Equality Impact Statement and look forward to seeing this data when further collated.
25. We know that teachers are not entirely motivated by financial reward but, in the current context, low salary and uncertain progression do not help. This is at the end of year 2 of a world pandemic, and teachers now face the challenges of the New Curriculum and the implementation of the ALNA 2018. We have an exhausted teacher workforce facing substantial educational changes amidst a still uncertain impact of continued COVID 19. As we have noted previously moderate pay increases do not impact on recruitment and retention.
26. Luke Sibieta's (14) review of school funding in response to Recommendation 1 of the Children & Young People's Committee July 2019 Report on Schools Funding in Wales analyses the financial impact of funding levels.
27. This has revealed a chronic under-funding of education in Wales. There has been a 6% fall in spending per learner since 2009/10. The recommendations include a move away from adopting a single minimum cost approach for use in spending decisions, to an approach of decision making on the basis of the evidence of the effects of school spending.
28. A 10% increase leads to an average improvement in outcomes of 7-10%, with larger effects for the more disadvantaged pupils. He further recommends extra funding for more deprived schools, as well as for those with sixth forms. In reference to teachers pay, the main driver of costs in schools, his analysis shows that if Wales followed the previous English approach of committing to increase starting salaries to £30,000 (now planned for 2023/24), then school costs would be expected to grow by 8% 2019/20 to 2022/23 (on the assumption that other pay grows at 3%) or about 6% (on the assumption that other pay grows at 2%). This provides an indication of the likely amount school funding per learner will need to grow by to prevent real term cuts to resources.

Voice Community therefore calls on the IWPRB to:

- Recommend an across-the-board increase of at least 10% to prevent any further fall back in real terms pay (RPI 2021 is estimated to be 7.5% for 2022 (Bank of England (15)).
- Recommend that this increase is fully funded by the Welsh Government.
- Ensure that the pay framework provides a clear career pathway, meets current challenges and provides an attractive offer for teachers at all career stages, thereby fulfilling the Minister's previous commitment to increasing the number of teachers in Wales.

- Recommend that the PPA is increased from 10% to 20% and identify other avenues of creating slack in the system to support resilience and address workload issues.
- Seek to establish sustainable and appropriate pay levels in the long term, more attuned to supporting a resilient, stable and secure teaching profession, able to support the economic recovery required. Future pay awards should not erode the pay differentials, and the recommend research projects named at the end of this submission should be used to explore the possibly discriminatory use of TLRs and supply provision via agencies.
- Work to ensure that teaching re-claims its place in today's graduate job market.

Recruitment and Retention

The Graduate Labour Market

29. The following information and analysis refer to the most recent available data that Voice Community had been able to obtain when this submission was drafted. The economic impact of the pandemic is affecting everyone, some have been more affected than others and the low paid are particularly hit by COVID 19. House of Common Economic Indicators January 2022 note a global projection for GDP as 4.4% worldwide. The UK is forecast to see the fastest growth in the G7 in 2022, after seeing the largest fall in 2020 (GDP International Comparisons 2022 (16)). This is predicted to be 6% GDP growth in 2022 by Statistica UK. This is a buoyant economy where competitive employment can have an impact on teacher recruitment and retention (Forecasted annual growth of gross domestic product in the United Kingdom from 2021 to 2026 (17)).
30. As previously mentioned, given that education is at the root of economic recovery it is vital that we ensure Wales has a resilient, stable and secure teaching profession able to provide the support our school children and young people need in this recovery period. Workload and stress are increasingly cited as reasons for leaving the profession by teachers in the Educational Support Teacher Wellbeing Index 2021 (18) where 54% of staff quoted this as the reasons for considering leaving the profession. It is as vital as ever that teachers' pay and conditions properly value and respect their work as professionals. In this current working climate of exhaustion, continuing demands where teachers are stretched beyond their limits, facing major changes in the educational environment due to the New Curriculum and ALNA 2018 implementation, the compensation for poor working conditions needs to be of such a level as to significantly balance the severe impact on teacher workload and conditions leading to higher stress levels. The Education Support Wellbeing Survey reports 70% of staff are experiencing stress (18).
31. The Workforce Education Council in their survey 2021 have captured the demands from teachers regarding their workload. Staff completing the survey comment on the nature of the investment needed: less

administration/paperwork/meetings, more PPA time of 20%, recruit more teaching assistants and teachers to deal with the workload (137 comments) (EWC Education Workforce Survey 2021 (19)).

32. Therefore, Voice Community asserts, the Welsh Government has an imperative to ensure that sufficient teachers are recruited and retained in Wales in order for the New Curriculum to be successfully implemented and for standards to be as high as possible. It is clear from evidence from a range of sources that there is a need to address a fractured recruitment highlighted by the number of decreasing applications per post which needs to be addressed immediately.
33. The employment market in Wales is also buoyant. Employment stands at 74.1%, unemployment is 3.4%. The employment rate is above the pre-pandemic levels. Redundancy levels in September 21 was 1.8 per 1000 which is in sharp contrast to the redundancies taking place in the height of the pandemic. Median pay has been above pre-pandemic levels since October 2020, and has plateaued since May 2021 (Labour Market Overview Statistics for Wales 2022 (20)).
34. This buoyancy is reflected in the graduate employment market. Earnings generally increased by 5.3% to April 2021 ASHE Data 2021 (21)). The Guardian reported in January 2022, that senior professionals could see pay rises of 25%. Professional services companies are budgeting for pay rises of between 10% and 15%. This is more than inflation and is a practice being followed to prevent staff leaving for rival companies. In the past year wages for new starters grew on average 6% to 8% (22).
35. With regard to graduate employment, 2020/21, UK data from the research organisation, Luminate 2021 (part of the Higher Education Careers Service Unit (23)) , reveals a graduate labour market affected by the pandemic in terms of their mental health. Young people are responding to high levels of change, and uncertainty in plans, where a lack of work experience is a real issue. The challenges of the last two years have led to struggles with mental health, this has been an atypical experience. Young people are prioritising the companies that provide CPD, above salary considerations. The challenges of the past year have affected motivations which is rated as at 25%. Because of the uncertainty graduates have considered a change in their career plans, moving into health care and the public sector generally as these were seen as the more stable employment routes. In order of priority the criteria of training and development was more important than anything else, followed by progression, work life balance, salary, then skills for the job. The graduate labour market has not collapsed. The ONS total jobs online adverts in April 2021 was 99% average of the level for February 2020. 7% of graduates favoured education, health was 11% and finance at 9%. The report clarifies that graduates express a lack of confidence in the current jobs on offer, they seem unprepared in their plans, there is a lack of work experience. The conclusion is that there is more need for support in-work with good mentoring and particular support from line managers. This high level of other current graduate recruitment in 2021 provides a recruitment challenge for the education sector, particularly in competition with health and finance. A strong response from Welsh Government is needed to

ensure education is an attractive alternative. Given the reflection on pay increases in professional employment cited above, and the influence of workload, as well as the spoken need for support from new graduates – both pay and work conditions are both areas which need significant improvements.

36. According to EWC workforce statistics the number of teachers working in Wales are falling year on year:

- 2017 total 36,426
- 2021 total 34,766
- A reduction of 1660 over 4 years.

37. This year-on-year reduction is the most worrying statistic, at a time when the demands on teachers are increasing. (Education Workforce Statistics Wales 2021 (24)).

38. Stats Wales demonstrates the impact of this reduction in year 2019/20 to 2020/21 by role where the tendency is for the upper levels to increase and the lower levels to decrease.

	2019/20	2020/21
Leading practitioners	75	90
Executive head teachers	50	60
Headteachers	1310	1255
Acting headteachers	120	115
Assistant headteachers	986	960
Classroom teachers	21810	21360

(25).

39. The 2% drop in classroom teachers is within expected results following the on year small % decreases since 2014 – this embedded trend will only change when the pay and conditions issues are addressed by Welsh Government.

The recruitment and retention crisis are also mirrored in the age population making up the teacher workforce:

Classroom teachers:

	2019/20	2020/21
Under 25	6595	6470
25-29	1840	1770
30-39	7675	7200
40-49	6435	6605
50-59	3155	3405
60+	365	370
total	21810	21360

(25)

40. OECD comments that the aging teacher workforce common across all OECD countries has implications for recruitment (OECD 2021 (4)). They comment that salaries have a direct impact on attractiveness to enrol, to become a teacher after graduation, to return to the teaching profession, and to remain. The higher the teacher's salary the fewer people choose to leave the profession. Compensation and working conditions are important for attracting, developing and retaining staff. The direction is to carefully consider salaries and career prospects (p358).
41. In 2019/20 regional Wales-specific data from Luminate (23) shows that there has been a 3.8% increase in the number of graduates in professional-level jobs since 2015/16, and those domiciled in South Wales were slightly more likely to obtain professional-level employment than elsewhere. Education is one of the biggest industries in the country, second only to Health, employing 12.7% of graduates, with only a small year-on-year decline of 1.9%, although it must be borne-in-mind that the population of Wales is increasing year-on-year at the same time. In 2020 the population increased to 3,230,500 (estimate May 2020). The decline in those employed in education and a rise in the population can only increase the need for teachers in Wales over the coming years.
42. Further, graduates in Wales tend to gravitate towards the larger cities, predominantly in the South of the country. The most popular locations include Cardiff (26.8%) Swansea (8%) and Newport (9.8%) (13). Graduate starting salaries at the UK's leading graduate employers are expected to remain unchanged at a median average of £30,000 for the seventh consecutive year but with 15% of places in the top graduate employers now providing starting salaries of more than £45,000, this is significantly in excess of the starting salary for teachers (Highfliers 2021 (26)).
43. In fact, an analysis of graduate salaries in 2021, by industry or business sector, shows that the public sector offers amongst the lowest of median graduate starting salaries at £24,200. Wales education is slightly higher at the current minima of the main pay range, (which is £27,491) and significantly lower than the median average for all sectors. We also note that graduates in Wales receive the lowest average starting salary at £20,600 (although male graduates earn more than their female counterparts at £21,395 to £20,144 respectively). Although it could then be argued that a teacher's starting salary in Wales compares favourably to this, the sector still is failing to recruit in sufficient numbers. This probably reflects on other concerns of teachers regarding the status of the profession, career progression, workload, and work life balance - a point to which we will be returning later. The starting salary is still below graduate wage average of £30,000, a continued barrier to ITE recruitment.
44. Providing the funding is made available from Welsh Government, this could well be an ideal opportunity to recruit the needed professionals to education; to support our school children and young people and providing a long-term resource for the country on which economic recovery can be well based. Teacher recruitment difficulties are even more marked in the West and North of

Wales, particularly in rural areas, and for Welsh medium schools. In this context, it is even more vital that graduates perceive a career in teaching to provide attractive working conditions, alongside appropriate and commensurate remuneration. Voice Community believes a teaching profession which is resilient, stable and secure is one which can address recruitment problems before these areas of pressure are further exacerbated.

Recruitment to Initial Teacher Education

45. The Welsh Government's national workforce development plan 2019 – 2021 (27) states that, 'we recognise the importance of ensuring that teaching as a profession is well promoted and seen as an attractive proposition in the competitive field of graduate recruitment' (24). However, both the numbers of those entering and completing Initial Teacher Education ('ITE') and those continuing in the profession through their careers show significant declines over the past 20 years.
46. With regard to the numbers of ITE students, The Welsh Government's Teachers' Planning Supply Model sets a cap on numbers to recruit to Initial Teacher Education courses. These targets are based on school sector and on postgraduate or undergraduate courses. Statistics released by the Education Workforce Council Wales May 2021 continue to cause concern. The number passing ITE have been reducing since 2003 at 2251, for 2021 this figure stands at 1231 (slight increase on last year). Whilst the EWCW comments that there is no crisis in teacher recruitment and retention, but some concern for the middle phase of experienced teachers, significantly the Nuffield Foundation (28) notes that 'the Welsh school system faces a substantial and growing challenge for ensuring there are sufficient teachers. The recruitment and retention challenge are most acute in the secondary schools....' The number of secondary school trainee teachers have been reducing year on year with an increasing below target recruitment to ITE since 2013/14. This is against a backdrop of rising pupil teacher ratio, and an expected bulge in pupil number in 2024. For primary schools ITE recruitment has been below target since 2015/16. Across schools in Wales current April 2021 pupil teacher ratio average schools is 20.6 an increase from 18.4 in 2015 (Schools Census Results 2021 (29)).
47. The number of students able to speak Welsh is rising 23.8% in 2016 and now 24.1% in 2021 primary, and in secondary 21.11% in 2016, and 22.79% in 2021 (PLASC Data 2021 (30))
48. At the same time the numbers of teachers able to function through the medium of Welsh has decreased by 125 from 2020 to 2021 (Stats Wales 2021 below).

	2019/20	2020/21
Teaching working in Welsh in current post	6595	6470
Able to teach in Welsh but not at the moment	1840	1770

Teaching Welsh as a subject only	8030	7740
Unable to teach or work in Welsh	10335	9950
	268880	25930

49. It should also be remembered that a certain number of students fail to complete the ITE course because they have failed or withdrawn from the course (11.3% in 2018-2019, and 9.0% 2019-2020)¹⁹. Taking this into account, the Education Workforce Council's ("EWC" (24)) ITE Student Results 2019-2020 shows that the number of students successfully completing Initial Teacher Education in Wales has fallen by roughly 1,200 students in sixteen years, (from 2251 in 2002-2003 to 975 in 2019 to 2020). Further, a proportion of students decide not to continue with teaching as a career even after successfully completing ITE. This is a worrying decline in those students completing ITE who then are able to, and choose to, progress to become NQTs.

50. Paras. 30 – 50 here highlight that teaching as a profession is failing to recruit. In terms of attractiveness of the profession, a below average starting graduate salary, and the known pressured workload will have a detrimental impact (Egan et al (17)).

Recruitment and Retention in the Profession.

51. Voice Community has always emphasised the importance of retaining the existing workforce in addition to attracting new recruits, including those in the first five years of their careers. The EWC Statistics 2021 (the most recent data) shows that there has been a decrease in teacher numbers in Wales (24). The number of registered schoolteachers has declined year on year since 2010 with a 10.6% drop between then and 2021 (38,896 in 2010; 34,766 in 2021, whilst the pupil number is growing. The majority are female (75.7%). There has been a gradual decrease in male teachers down 28.1% in 2002 to 24.3% in 2021 EWC Workforce Stats (24) . This is a shocking statistic.

52. The number of teachers able to function through the medium of Welsh has decreased by 125 from 2020 to 2021 (Stats Wales 2021 above (25)).

53. Whilst there does not appear to be a significant decline in the numbers of teachers in STEM subjects between 2019 and 2021, there is a significant disparity between those trained in a science subject but teaching in another subject. This data indicates shortages of teachers in the Welsh medium, which may significantly impede the successful implementation of the Welsh Government strategy for a million Welsh speakers by 2050, and in science subjects because there are insufficient teachers to teach the subjects in which they were trained. The decrease in STEM subjects taught by teachers trained in subject has decreased between 1% and 3% from 2019 to 2021 and again spells an establishing trend.

	2019		2021	
	Trained in subject %	Trained in another subject %	Trained in subject %	Trained in another subject %
Biology	58.4%	41	56.6	41.1
Chemistry	49.5	49.3	47.5	49.5
English	74.8	22.0	73.9	22.6
Mathematics	79.5	18.2	77	19.9
Physics	44.3	54.1	41.9	56.1
Science	34.2	63.5	34.3	63.2
Welsh	74.2	24.4	72.2	25.7

(24)

54. Luke Sibieta comments that a degree in subject taught is a good indicator of the quality of teaching being delivered (Teacher Shortages in England 2020 (7)). This comment highlights that quality is at risk.

55. The Education Endowment Foundation Impact of School Closure on the Attainment Gap 2020 (31) has estimated that the recent COVID 19 created closures are likely to widen the attainment gap from between 11% to 75% in England. The impact on the attainment gap in Wales is likely to be similar. Real concerns are also being raised about the effect the pandemic has had on children's, mental health with a 25% rise in referrals for mental health services over the last two years (The Guardian Feb 2022 (32)). Teach First cite a pilot in Noel-Baker Academy in Derby where a doubling of PPA to 20% led to an increase in pupil attainment. The reasons behind this is the impact this time had on the quality and effectiveness of planning for lessons (43).

56. The number of posts advertised in secondary schools decreased from 2019 at 1571, to 2020 at 1212. applications received for posts advertised have also decreased 2019 /20 16,992, and 2020/21 at 14188, and appointments were 2019/20 1440, in 2020/21 the figure is 1101. This points to a decreasing pool of interested and appointable applicants indicating a need to revitalise the role of teaching as highly desirable and rewarding professions to reverse this trend.

57. The number of teachers in Wales has decreased by 5.5% 2017 to 2021, at the same time there has been a decrease in the STEM subjects taught and subject trained which reflects on quality, these are huge challenges alone but also are coupled with the immense pressure from the COVID 19 impact on pupils' mental health and their learning recovery. This dire situation calls for response from Welsh government which address significant pay increase and other structural measures to address an increasing workload.
(EWC (24))

58. In particular an EWC policy briefing Teacher Recruitment and Retention in Wales 2020 in October 2020 (33), highlighted that the EWC's particular recruitment and retention concerns were, a) those relating to new teachers as 85% of NQT's were in fixed contract or supply positions, b) specific subjects at secondary

schools (such as science), c) teachers in the Welsh medium and). Although this was over two years ago, we believe that these concerns are still reflected today.

59. The number of headteachers has declined from 1310 in 2020 to 1255 in 2021. This reflects on an unsupported leader/headteacher pathway and career progression. Whilst pay can be a pull factor in taking on further responsibility we also know that the visible workload and impact on life work balance acts as a barrier for those with the right skills to step forward. The IWPRB 2020 described this as ‘to support an effective career pathway for school leaders the level of pay on offer must be sufficient that people stepping up to such a leadership position feel that they are being fairly remunerated for the additional responsibilities and pressures’.
60. Pay is an important factor in the retention of the school workforce, but Voice Community acknowledges that there are other contributory factors. The October 2020 EWC policy event (33) named a number of factors as relevant in respect of retention e.g., wellbeing, pay & conditions, competition from England, career structure, professional learning, workload, bureaucracy, accountability, the wider economy - as well as the specifics named above.
61. The Education Support Partnership (“ESP” (18)) is a charity supported by Voice Community, along with several other education and support staff unions, and is dedicated to improving the health and wellbeing of the entire education workforce.
62. The ESP Teacher Wellbeing Index 2020 provides stark findings that explain why the retention of teachers in Wales a serious issue (18).
63. The Warwick-Edinburgh scale score is calculated by assimilating responses from a self-administered questionnaire. Respondent teachers in Wales scored 43.9% which is down from last year, which is significantly lower than the Welsh Government general population score of 49.4%. Further response show that 2021:
- 72% of teachers described themselves as stressed – up 10% from previous year.
 - 46% always go to work even when feeling unwell.
 - 54% had considered leaving the profession due to mental health pressure.
 - 72% of staff were stressed.
 - 35% worked 51 + hours per week.
 - 66% of senior leaders worked 51+ hours per week.
64. The Education Support Survey reported that their wellbeing would be improved by reduction of unnecessary paperwork 48% and to reduce the volume of workload 43%. (Teacher Wellbeing Index (18)).
65. As a result of these findings, the ESP concludes that retention and stress appear to be closely linked, and that workload remains the most important work-related factor determining wellbeing. In its recommendations, the ESP states that, ‘Overwork has become normalised across education. Healthy working practices

and boundaries need to become the new, celebrated norm. With improved levels of health, teachers will be more physically and emotionally present to learners (above) This finding in particular points to the urgency of dealing with issues of working conditions for teachers in order to ensure a resilient, stable, secure teaching profession. CEO Sinead McBrearty has described this as 'staff workload continues to be a serious issue that directly affects the mental health and retention of talented staff' (ESA (18)). 2020 report.

66. There is further comment on the importance of workload from the EWC School Teacher National Education Workforce Survey 2021. The open text comments:

- Less admin/paperwork/meetings
- More PPA time – 5 hours a fortnight is nowhere enough, teachers need 20% PPA.
- Recruitment to deal with workload. 137 comments.
- Adjustments needed for ALN students.

The top lines from this national Survey are:

- 15.9% of schoolteachers thinking of leaving the profession in the next three years.
- 7% of senior leaders are thinking of leaving the profession in the next three years.
- 56 hours worked per week for schoolteachers
- 70.4% disagreed strongly that they were able to manage their workload.

67. In relation to workload the suggestions made to resolve this focused strongly on recruitment, increased PPA and a change to marking policy (to verbal feedback, all class feedback and pupil self-reflection) (EWC National Education Workforce Survey (19)).

68. Of striking importance in this consideration of workload factors is the World Health Organisation (2021 (43)) report which states that long working hours led to 745,000 deaths from stroke and ischemic heart disease in 2016, a 29% increase since 2000. These diseases result from working hours of more than 55 hours per week. The WEC National Education Workforce Survey (19) result identifies that teachers declare working more than 56 hours per week.

69. Voice Community believes that it is essential to tackle workload issues once and for all, and that the accountability culture endemic throughout the whole of the education sector, which creates much of the bureaucratic workload at all levels of the profession has to change. The Welsh Government and all stakeholders in the education sector have to move quickly to ensure that sufficient teachers are retained in the profession. There is also an imperative to ensure that the implementation of the new curriculum, whenever it happens, does not place unreasonable workload pressures on teachers. The New Curriculum has at its core an innovative and creative teacher, able to design and implement local curriculum, unrestricted by unnecessary bureaucracy. Success for our education system in the future depends on this workload issue being resolved.

70. The push and pull of comparative pay and working conditions influence teachers' decisions to remain in the profession. Working conditions have a stronger influence, and moderate pay rises do not impact retention (Teacher Recruitment and Retention in England (34)) unless targeted to the shortage subjects such as STEM, Welsh Medium, SAN etc. For the veteran teacher intrinsic values such as professional mastery and autonomy are strong motivations for retention. They have identified workload and lack of support as spoken reasons for leaving findings which mirror the conclusion of the Educational Support Report 2021 (18). What is also important to note is that these are two areas of the education environment which are open to change and improvement. In a particular study of attrition in urban schools, the rate at which teachers left was described as a revolving door (Waddell J, (35)) in balancing the push factors this research identified professional learning communities and support from headteachers and leaders as crucial in fostering relationships to build retention. Of all professions teaching is one of building relationships. These levers are blocked by named barriers of lack of time and high workloads.
71. A separate survey of teachers, leaders, and governors view of the pay framework identified retention suggestions as protected time (PPA), sabbaticals, research breaks, fully supported CPD. The overall view was that overwork was the key and an appropriate response would be to employ more staff 'they would rather see more teachers employed which would mean a reduction in working hours than an in pay to continue performing the same amount of work. *'This would be a greater retention aid than money', (my italics)* (Dawson et al 2019 Teachers leaders and Governors Views on the Pay Framework (36)).
72. Therefore, Voice Community considers that the main factors required to retain teachers are:
- a. Fair pay
 - b. Reduced bureaucratic workload
 - c. More support in school
 - d. An increase in PPA to 20%
 - e. Transparent and achievable career progression

Vacancies, Application Numbers and Future Demand.

73. There appears to be an upward trend in the number of vacancies for education staff throughout the UK. The UK data from the Office for National Statistics (18) shows an increase in vacancies in education (which very probably also includes support staff in addition to teachers) of 66% between the second quarter of 2001 and the first quarter of 2020, and a 7% increase in vacancies compared with the same quarter in 2019.
74. Jack Worth, NFER, School Workforce Lead (37) commented "our findings suggest that the teacher labour market in Wales has been weakening in recent years, with teacher recruitment and retention trends showing an under-recruitment of trainee teachers, a dwindling pool of applicants and secondary vacancies increasingly going unfilled. These trends raise concerns that a

continued decline in teacher numbers could lead to an increasing pupil - teacher ratio, and potentially teacher shortages in the future.” He further describes a substantial and growing challenge of recruitment and retention in secondary schools, shortage subjects (Welsh, maths, science and MFL), in Welsh medium, rural and disadvantaged school. This again mirrors the findings of Luke Sibieta’s report on school funding in Wales.

75. A further indication of a shortage of teachers is the decrease in the number of applicants for teaching posts in all sectors in Wales over time. Ballpark figures show that the numbers of applications for posts in all schools in Wales fell by around 28% (22,597) between 2007 (22,597) and 2020 (16,324), this is even more marked in Welsh medium schools (18).
76. The most recent data on the average number of applications per post for headteacher/deputy headteacher shows that positions fell from 18.5 applications in 2014 to 5.6 applications in 2016 (18). This also impacts on the quality of those recruited. Difficulty in recruiting in rural schools has been described by a study into rural retention as ‘staffing with inequitable concentration of inexperienced teachers who are left to labour on their own to reach the needs of students’. The IWPRB 2020 described the position ‘there is strong evidence that the teacher supply situation has continued over the last year. Pay is clearly not the only cause of these trends in recruitment and retention and the high demands on teachers due to workload and accountability are significant factors, particularly in relation to retention’.
77. Overall, there is reduction in the number of schools in Wales. Increases have been seen in middle schools, and in federated schools, and headteachers covering more than one school. These reduction in numbers and increase in responsibilities mark a looming challenge for the future. This is becoming increasingly significant due to the higher percentage of career deputies unwilling to take up the senior roles ‘to support an effective career pathway for school leaders the level of pay on offer must be sufficient that people stepping up to such leadership positions feel that they are being fairly remunerated for the additional responsibilities and pressures they are taking on’ IWPRB 2020.
78. Stats Wales (25) data also shows a rise in projected pupil numbers over the next five years from 468,000 in 2020 to 471,900 in 2025, thus corresponding with the general rise in the population of Wales. This increase in secondary school pupils is in keeping with other parts of the UK, (the number of pupils in primary schools is expected to decrease).
79. This data confirms Voice Community’s long held anxiety that pupil increases will have an impact in secondary schools, where teacher recruitment and retention is at the most vulnerable. Any reduction in the numbers entering ITE and ongoing teacher attrition will exacerbate this situation. Therefore, in this current climate, teachers’ pay and conditions in Wales will assume even greater significance as the teaching profession competes with more attractive opportunities in the graduate labour market.

Matters for recommendation

For implementation from September 2022

Pay Range Levels from 2022

80. Voice Community welcomed the Prime Minister's previous announcement that he intended to raise the starting salary for teachers in England to £30,000 by 2022 and noted the change of policy to a proposed 2023/24 implementation with disappointment. We welcomed Welsh Government commitment to 'no detriment' and would ask that this commitment be honoured and be fully covered by either the funding made available by Westminster to the Welsh Government, or then we would expect the Welsh Government to allocate sufficient funds to cover the balance so that the 'no detriment promise' remains. Further, we are clear that this move, and any interim increases to pave the way to this level of salary, must also be reflected in the rest of the pay structure. This will mean significant investment in schools to enable them to implement these changes.
81. Therefore, Voice Community remains convinced that salary increases made since the lifting of the 1% cap have remained insufficient to address the real term losses sustained by teachers over the last ten years. We therefore ask the IWPRB to commit to ensuring that there is no lower pay increase in Wales than in England (or in Scotland or Northern Ireland). We believe that an across the board pay increase of between 10% in Wales, irrespective of career stage, sector, subject area or location, will ensure that no detriment or fall back occurs.
82. We also believe that it is not enough to have an attractive starting salary if it is not followed by an equally attractive prospect of career progression. Pay differentials need to be maintained in order to retain teachers over the long term because, otherwise, there is a distortion of spine points within the range. Leading on from this, lack of differentiation of pay points may narrow the distinction between the main pay range when compared to other pay ranges used in the profession. We agree that teaching needs a competitive and attractive starting salary and attempts in this direction have already been made. However, our more experienced members tell us that recent pay increases have had the negative effect of making them feel forgotten and undervalued, and there is still a recruitment shortage. We should also note that the most experienced teachers both provide support for NQTs and have a higher learner outcome rate than teacher fewer years. The experienced teacher has an impact of 10% more effect on learner outcome (Luke Sibieta (7)). This experience should be harnessed, valued and shared.
83. Any possible future increase in a starting salary to £30,000 cannot be viewed in isolation and must be complemented with differentiated pay points in proportion with the minimum pay point. Therefore, we ask for a uniform pay increase in 2022/23 of a minimum of 10% for all pay ranges, irrespective of career stage, sector, subject area or location. Some comparative statistics are given below.

Comparison between Experienced Teachers and other Graduate Professions.

84. Deferred compensation, which rewards employees for staying in the organisation or professions, and for meeting established performance criteria, is also used in teacher's salary structures. Other elements in employment packages play an important in the attractiveness of the profession, and teaching does not always do this (Egan, D. et al 2019. Cardiff.ac (38)).
85. The Independent Welsh Pay Review Body calculated the mean (mid-range) full-time salary for secondary school teachers in Wales/the UK is £39,279 with secondary school teachers getting salaries similar to chartered accountants, medical radiographers, architects and some professional engineering (civil and mechanical). Primary school teachers have salaries comparable to social workers and midwives.
86. Teacher salaries across all levels are 81-96% of the earnings of other tertiary educated workers in OECD countries (OECD 2021 (4)).
87. There are other negative differentials: male secondary teacher's salaries are 20% lower than other tertiary educated male workers. Females earn 3% more than comparable tertiary female workers.
88. Salaries increase with the level of education taught. The actual salary of a school head is on average are more than 51% higher than teachers of primary and secondary across OECD countries (OECD 2021 (4)).
89. For lower secondary schools with the most prevalent qualifications average starting salaries are 29% higher than starting salaries in the after 10 years of experience. This is 38% higher after 15 years of experience.
90. At lower secondary level of education on average across OECD countries starting salary for teacher of 15 years' experience and most prevalent qualifications is 40% higher than a teacher starting out with minimum qualifications.
91. Comparative levels need to be maintained across the salary scales to address retention of the more experienced teachers.

Amendments with particular consider of Recommendation 5: IWPRB recommend that Welsh Government consult on a change in the provision the STPC(W)D to allow part time teachers to receive fulltime TLR 1 and TLR 2, including schools using their own discretion.

92. The national pay scales cover the MPS and UPS for classroom teachers, TLRs, lead practitioner roles, leadership group and head teachers. Voice Community sees these as allowing for a flexible approach to addressing the needs of a school in delivering high-quality education, able to realise on year improvements, and maximising the skills of the workforce. A headteacher has described the flexibility these additionalities offer as 'TLRs are useful as they allow us to give teachers added responsibility and assess their potential for the leadership using positions without to jump them across onto the points spine (Dawson et al (36)). Allowances are a cost-effective way of addressing priorities without going to

additional recruitment’.

93. The various flexibilities allow teachers to develop their own skills through CPD and practice, as well contributing to school improvements. There is a consistent call for clarity on how teachers move from the main to the upper scale. There are also calls on the need for clarity on the distinction between ‘roles’ or ‘tasks’ allocated to middle management positions, lead practitioner positions, or TLRs. The feedback is that the awards of the different additionalities reflect favouritism and address retentions needs. The allocation of TLRs is also felt not to reflect the time specified for the task preparation, an unfair acknowledgement particularly disadvantaging the role of SEN/ALNCo, and benefiting the core subjects more than the smaller subjects’ areas (30). It is of benefit to keep the flexibilities offered by these roles. A lack of clarity by using discretionary awards contributes to unfairness which can also be a factor in gender discrimination. Voice Community recommends an increased clarity and transparency, as these are known factors able to combat this sense of unfairness, supporting a wider application of awards across the characteristics within the teaching profession.

Voice Community recommends that TLR payments are placed on a statutory basis to address the inequality embedded in discretionary payments, and that full time awards of TLR payments be made to part time teachers where the work justifies this, this will again address the gender inequality embedded, as the part time workforce is largely made up of women teachers.

94. Removal of the part time allocation as a default position addresses the fact that the role is often a discrete responsibility not divisible due to position of part time or full time employed.
95. The % award for a TLR should be determined on the question of whether the teacher, part time or full time is carrying out the full remit of the responsibilities awarded and that the stipulation 40.1 should reflect that.

Amendments with particular consideration of how ALNCo’s should be paid.

96. Voice Community recommends that a review of the current payments made to SENCos/ALNCos is conducted to identify exactly the processes currently adopted to remunerate this group. There are a number of pathways utilised to furnish additional payments. Welsh Government points out that there are about 22% of learners in maintained schools with ALN, whose academic achievements in relation to other learners is poor (Welsh Government (44)). The role has been developing with expanded responsibilities. This is a striking example of Welsh Government policy being designed and implemented with no assessment of the extra workload involved, thereby increasing the workload of teachers and teaching assistants without further resources to support them.
97. The additional roles are identified as: identifying learners with ALN, devising individual learning plans, securing relevant services for children, keeping up to date with legislation policies and procedures. ALNCos are already reporting that they are finding their role strenuous, and this affects wellbeing. Feedback from a pilot conducted in 2014 stated that the Individual Development Plan took up considerably more time than the previous SEN approach. The number of children entitled to access this support has increased from 20,000, to 100,000.(

STATS Wales 2020 (39)). Interesting the Welsh Government Improving Wellbeing and Reducing Bureaucracy Workgroup has identified this area as one that needs investigation to identify the impact on workload.

98. ALN Coordinators will need recognised time to carry out their role. The administration tasks required to arrange the multi-disciplinary team meeting in support of the children are time consuming and take teachers away from the classroom. This change in emphasis of work results in more responsibility being given to teaching assistants in carrying out the tasks and this also needs to be considered in any review of the implementation of this new approach.
99. There is a mixed approach to paying for this role with TLR's, allowances, and inclusion on the senior leadership team utilised as methods of compensating for the added work in this role. Voice Community recommends that the ALNCo role be fully integrated into the senior leadership team as part of that statutory scale. This will reflect the responsibility of the role, give adequate status to the role in reflection of the number of children receiving ALN support, and address inconsistencies across school settings in the manner in which this group are compensated (Jarvis S (40))

Amendments with consideration to the case for separate teacher main and upper scales.

100. Voice Community recommends the removal of the distinction of the main and upper teacher pay scales. This is based on the known increased expectation placed on teachers on the upper scale to take on extra management tasks beyond the teacher role without extra compensation, the removal of the distinction normalises the appropriateness of the award for the more experienced teacher, it also addresses lack of clarity on moving from one scale to the other.

Consideration of Leadership Group Pay Scales.

101. Voice Community believes that these scales are fit for purpose and do not need to be amended with the provision that the uplift of 10% for year 2022/23 is applied across the board. There may be opportunity to further research the optimum gap between the top of UPS and bottom of Leadership Group Pay Scale to stimulate the move from experienced teacher to leader and ensure a continuous pipeline in supply. But any recommendations on such an adjustment should only be done with due research identifying optimum drivers in this step and bearing in mind the impact this may have on smaller schools.

Consideration of specific pay scale of headteachers accountable for more than one school.

102. There are relatively few of these Executive Heads in Wales. An appropriate system would be one able to manage that complexity, enabling a Board to appoint an Executive Head to the appropriate point.
103. It is helpful to think of an Executive Headteachers as the strategic leader of more than one school or equivalent responsibility. It is a

complex role that is deployed in a range of contexts and structures to address different priorities. There is no one-size-fits-all when it comes to the role of Executive Headteacher.

104. A tool to manage complexity is a weighted matrix, with appropriate points attached to each element. Matters for inclusion in a matrix would encompass the following:

Context and need of schools Time available to the EHT Other roles in the leadership group which carry out aspects of management and leadership roles, defining the division of roles The difficulties in recruitment for that location	Issues relating to standards and the level of improvement needed across the sites, e.g., poor Estyn inspection The challenge in this role in managing a variety of school sites. The experiences and strengths of the individual.
---	---

105. The responsibility for deciding the range of remuneration available lies within the ISP(W)RB scope and the Teachers Pay and Conditions Wales. This range should reflect the complexity in a weighted matrix as referred to above. The individual allocation for an Executive Head at some point on that range need to rest with the stakeholder group establishing and managing the role.

National Scale for TLRs allowances.

106. TLRs holders work is focussed on enhancing teaching and learning. To qualify for a TLR a teacher would need to be 'accountable for a specific and sustained responsibility, that is set out in the schools published staffing structure, needed to ensure continued delivery of high-quality teaching and learning which requires professional skills and judgement. They include an element of leadership in managing and developing a subject or curriculum area, or to lead and manage pupil development across the curriculum. TLR1 includes line management responsibilities.
107. There is a lack of clarity, and clear overlap between the different 'role nominations. Moreover, findings from a survey conducted in England from 2018 on the pay framework (but we would argue also applicable to the situation in Wales), commissioned by the Department of Education from the Institute for Employment Studies, shows that there are widespread difficulties with the way that TLRs are understood and awarded.
108. There is a call for a greater level of clarity in how TLRs are advertised in schools and what is required in terms of additional responsibilities. Concern was raised about the lack of consistency within schools and across different schools in using the allowances. Some teachers reported they are largely left to find out the information for themselves and from each other, in spite of clear school guidelines being available on websites etc. This can lead to misconceptions.

109. Implementation of set scales for these allowances would increase openness and transparency and address possible inequalities that discretion can often allow to play.

Workload and Management of Time and Tasks split between Directed and Non-directed Time.

110. All schools in Wales operate according to the School Teachers' Pay and Conditions Document (STPCD) which states that a classroom teacher can only be directed by the headteacher to work for up to a maximum of 1,265 hours over 195 days of the year (this equates to 32.5 hours per 5 days). A maximum of 190 days involve teaching pupils/students, the remainder being non-teaching days where you may be asked to undertake other duties related to your role as a teacher. These are often known as in-service training days (INSET). These limits do not apply if you are paid on the leadership range. PPA is time dedicated for preparation, planning and assessment. This PPA non-directed time is not specified but is described as being open to the style and judgement of the teacher and covers tasks in preparation, marking, feedback and monitoring. It is currently set at 10% of teaching time. Reduced teaching time of an additional 10% is part of induction arrangements, more experienced teachers hold a diversified workload and spend less time teaching.
111. The lack of clarity on how much non-directed time is appropriate or expected or average makes it more difficult for teachers to challenge a high workload.
112. The OECD 2021 (4) report describes teaching time as a core activity for teachers, but in a large number of countries teachers spend most of their time on activities other than teaching. In 25 countries for lower secondary teachers, 44% of teacher time is spent on teaching, on average. Teachers do not have the discretion of whether or not to perform these tasks and they range from PPA, marking and feedback, parent communication are mandatory non-teaching tasks for teachers during their statutory working time (OECD (4)). These figures are an analysis of how the actual hours worked are weighted 44% for teacher time teaching. In Scotland this is 63%, Israel 59% of time is spent on teaching, Estonia spent 40% and Switzerland spent 43%. Wales is an outlier in allocating 10% time for PPA.
113. A variety of sources identify workload as a serious stress and retention issue (CooperGobson TES October 2020 (41)) Educational Support (22) name workload as the main reason for teacher's considering leaving the profession. Teachers describe working more than 50 hours a week (TES Hali Hughes October 2020 (41), + Education Support (18) October 2020). Teach First (43) have identified a link with an increased PPA to 20% and an improvement in the attainment gap (43).

114. Nuffield Foundation and UCL Institute of Education, September 2019 (15) report said teachers work an average of 47 hours a week in term time, eight hours more than teachers in comparable OECD countries. One in four teachers work more than 59 hours a week, while 10% work more than 65 hours per week. Around 40% said they usually work in the evening, and 10% during the weekend.
115. Workload has long been recognised as a retention issue for teachers with many citing this as their main reason for leaving. Whilst this aspect of teachers working days needs further research there are some actions, it is possible to implement immediately which would alleviate some of the pressure and provide the incentives to the more experienced teachers to remain - a feature which is urgently needed in the current pressures brought by the pandemic. Voice Community strongly recommends increasing the PPA time to 20%.
116. Teachers call for more time which is stronger now than ever before, given the increased pressures of the current crisis, the call for more teachers could not be timelier (Dawson et al (29)). Welsh Government should also bear in mind the link WHO (42) have identified between long hours and the development of stroke or heart disease.

Summary of Responses Regarding Recommendations for Implementation from September 2022.

In considering these recommendations we would ask that the IWPRB consider the dedication displayed by the education profession. They have maintained learning throughout the pandemic as well as providing for those children experiencing mental health, at risk or vulnerable, and those children of key workers needed to stay in work to provide care for all of us. Education staff have worked tirelessly, responding to the needs as arisen, volunteering for duties required to provide needed care in a national crisis. The impact of the pandemic demonstrates how much as communities we rely on the education staff. Voice Community is calling on the IWPRB to implement these recommendations as measures which will promote recruitment and retention of a resilient, stable and secure teaching profession.

117. Voice Community would also recommend taking a long-term view of the incentivisation needed in this sector. The WHO evidence on the increased incidence of the diseases stroke and heart disease as a result of working long hours highlights the dangers in ignoring this aspect of the impact of long hours (42).
118. We would recommend an across the board pay increase of 10%, irrespective of career stage, sector, subject area or location, as this will ensure that at least no detriment or fall back will occur.in Wales.
119. We would recommend increasing the PPA time allocation from 10% to 20%. This would address some aspects of long hours, but would also address an

improvement in pupil attainment as lesson planning is more effective (43).

120. We recommend that TLR payments are not defaulted to % application according to status of PT or FT employment, but award according to the amount of work needed for that particular TLR.
121. We further recommend that the TLR allowances are placed on a statutory scale to address the inequalities that can result from any discretionary payment.
122. We recommend that the current pay differentials are maintained, and no further erosion should take place.
123. We recommend further research be undertaken on the optimum differentials of all the statutory scales, to generate both recruitment and retention.
124. We recommend that the compensation for holders of executive head position be moved onto a matrix system, to enable clarity and transparency across the sector

References:

1. Welsh Agenda <https://www.iwa.wales/our-work/themes/the-welsh-agenda-2/?lang=cy>
2. Education Response to COVID 19 – Implications for Schools. 2021. Wales Centre for Public Policy <https://www.wcpp.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/The-education-response-to-Coronavirus.-Implications-for-schools-in-Wales.pdf>
3. Education Endowment Foundation <https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/evidence-summaries/attainment-gap/>
4. OECD Education at a Glance 2021 <https://www.oecd.org/education/education-at-a-glance/>
5. The Guardian January 2nd 2022. <https://www.theguardian.com/business/2022/jan/02/what-does-2022-hold-for-the-uk-economy-and-its-households>
6. OECD Turning Hope Into Reality 2020 <https://oecdecoscope.blog/2020/12/01/turning-hope-into-reality/>
7. Teacher Shortages in England. Luke Sibieta 2020. <https://epi.org.uk/publications-and-research/teacher-shortages-in-england-analysis-and-pay-options/>
8. Hanushek and Woessman. 2015. The Knowledge Capital of Nations 2015 CESIFO Books
9. UNESCO 2012 <https://en.unesco.org/themes/education-sustainable-development>
10. Hanushek et al 2010 <https://hanushek.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Hanushek%2BWoesmann%202010%20IntEncEduc%202.pdf>
11. Charleen Chiong https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/cte/start-teaching/secondary/interview_pre-reading_-_chiong_et_al_2017_berj_edited.pdf
12. A Review of Schoolteachers pay in England compared with other graduate professions IDR. 2019. <https://www.nasuwt.org.uk/static/uploaded/49a25028-b855-4925-bb4a14bc8107f0d7.pdf>
13. Teacher Shortages in England 2020 Education Policy Institute <https://epi.org.uk/publications-and-research/teacher-shortages-in-england-analysis-and-pay-options/>

14. Luke Sibieta School Funding System Wales Analysis 2020
<https://gov.wales/independent-report-provides-depth-analysis-school-funding-system-wales-and-makes-recommendations>
15. Bank of England Monetary Policy Report February 2022.
<https://www.bankofengland.co.uk/-/media/boe/files/monetary-policy-report/2022/february/monetary-policy-report-february-2022.pdf>
16. GDP – International Comparisons: Key Economic Indicators
<https://commonslibrary.parliament.uk/research-briefings/sn02784/2022>
17. Forecasted annual growth of gross domestic product in the United Kingdom from 2021 to 2026. <https://www.statista.com/statistics/375195/gdp-growth-forecast-uk/>
18. Educational Support Teacher Wellbeing Index 2021
<https://www.educationsupport.org.uk/resources/for-organisations/research/teacher-wellbeing-index/>
19. Education Workforce Survey 2021.
<https://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php/en/research-and-statistics/national-education-workforce-survey.html>
20. Labour Market Overview Statistics for Wales 2022 <https://gov.wales/labour-market-overview-january-2022>
21. ASHE Data 2021 (21)).
<https://www.ons.gov.uk/employmentandlabourmarket/peopleinwork/earningsandworkinghours/bulletins/annualsurveyofhoursandearnings/2021>
22. The Guardian January 2022.
<https://www.theguardian.com/business/2022/jan/11/workers-could-see-25-pay-rise-as-companies-fight-to-hold-on-to-staff>
23. Luminate 2021 (part of the Higher Education Careers Service Unit)
<https://luminate.prospects.ac.uk/early-careers-survey-2021-work-experience-during-a-crisis>
24. Education Workforce Statistics Wales 2021.
<https://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php/en/research-and-statistics/workforce-statistics.html>
25. Statistics Wales [2021](#)
<https://linkprotect.cudasvc.com/url?a=https%3a%2f%2fstatswales.gov.wales%2fCatalogue%2fEducation-and-Skills%2fSchools-and-Teachers>

26. Highfliers 2021
<https://linkprotect.cudasvc.com/url?a=https%3a%2f%2fwww.highfliers.co.uk>

27. Welsh Government's national workforce development plan 2019 – 2021.
<https://gov.wales/workforce-development-plan-2019-to-2021>

28. Nuffield Foundation. The Effect of Retention and Turnover on the Teaching Workforce. 2018. <https://www.nuffieldfoundation.org/project/the-effect-of-retention-and-turnover-on-the-teaching-workforce>

29. Schools Census Results 2021.
<https://linkprotect.cudasvc.com/url?a=https%3a%2f%2fgov.wales%2fschools-census-results-april-2021->

30. PLASC Data 2021.
<https://linkprotect.cudasvc.com/url?a=https%3a%2f%2fstatswales.gov.wales%2fCatalogue%2fEducation-and-Skills%2fSchools-and-Teachers%2fSchools-Census%2fPupil-Level-Annual-School-Census>

31. The Education Endowment Foundation Impact of School Closure on the Attainment Gap 2020. <https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/education-evidence/evidence-reviews/school-closures-rapid-evidence-assessment>.

32. The Guardian Feb 2022.
<https://www.theguardian.com.society.feb/socialworkers>

33. EWC Policy Briefing Teacher Recruitment and Retention in Wales 2020.
<https://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php/en/65-english/about/policy-briefing/1479-policy-briefing-2020.html>

34. Teacher Recruitment and Retention in England 2021.
<https://commonslibrary.parliament.uk/research-briefings/cbp-7222/>

35. **Waddell, J. Fostering Relationships to Improve retention**
<http://www.joci.ecu.edu/index.php/JoCI/article/viewFile/45/80>

36. Dawson et al 2019 Teachers, Leaders and Governors Views on the pay framework
https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/916028/Teachers_Pay_Framework_RR854.pdf

37. Nuffield Foundation Teacher Labour Market in Wales Annual Report 2020.
<https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED608761.pdf>

38. Egan et al. 2019. Graduate Recruitment: Teaching and Other Professions.
<https://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php/en/documents/research-and->

[statistics/research-reports/published-research/2030-graduate-recruitment-teaching-and-other-professions-e/file.html](https://gov.wales/statistics/research-reports/published-research/2030-graduate-recruitment-teaching-and-other-professions-e/file.html)

39. Stats Wales 2020. <https://gov.wales/summary-statistics-regions-wales-2020>

40. Jarvis S, SEN practice: Who leads the Way UWTSD/ECSDN 2021

41. <https://www.tes.com/author/haili-hughes>

42. World Health Organisation 2021. [Long working hours increasing deaths from heart disease and stroke: WHO, ILO](#)

43. Teach First PPA in Times Educational Supplement:
<https://www.tes.com/magazine/teaching-learning/general/why-doubling-ppa-could-help-tackle-attainment-gap>

44. Welsh Government 2020. [The additional learning needs transformation programme: frequently asked questions \[HTML\] | GOV.WALES](#)